

EXHIBIT A

African American Diversity Addendum

March 2021

This African American Diversity Addendum has been prepared at the direction of the Court to present data regarding hiring of African American teachers and administrators, and to highlight strategies employed by the District to recruit and retain African American teachers and administrators. The data requested by the Court appears in Section I below; Section II sets out specific issues called out by the Court, along with a description of current strategies aimed at specifically at African American candidates.

In addition, as directed by the Court, the District has attached to this Addendum its Report on HR Procedures for Recruiting African American Professional Staff, prepared in response to a prior directive from the Court. To make it very clear, the District continues to follow and utilized the procedures described in the Report on HR Procedures, although not all are addressed in the body of this Addendum.

I. Data on Employment and Hiring of African American Teachers and Administrators.

The District reports on the demographics of its teaching and administrative staff each year in its annual report. The District employs African American teachers at a rate higher than would be expected for the relevant labor market, considering the teacher demographics of the United States and the state of Arizona, as reflected in the chart below. Moreover, the trend over the last four years at the District is towards increasing diversity.

Percent of Teachers by Race and Ethnicity			
	Hispanic	White	AA
United States	7.8%	81.9	6.8%
Arizona	13.1%	80.1%	2.8%
TUSD 2016-17	28.1%	65.4%	3.0%
TUSD 2017-18	29.1%	64.2%	2.9%
TUSD 2018-19	29.0%	63.0%	3.4%
TUSD 2019-20	30.0%	61.9%	3.4%

The general population in the Tucson metropolitan area is 4 percent African American,¹ further demonstrating that the racial/ethnic breakdown of teaching staff in the District is close to matching that of the community.

¹ The Tucson CCD has a population of which an estimated 3.8% were African American. 2018: ACS 5-Year Estimates Subject Tables, Selected Characteristics of the Native and Foreign-Born Populations, Tucson CCD, Pima County, Arizona, U.S. CENSUS BUREAU, <https://data.census.gov/cedsci/table?q=Tucson%20CCD,%20Pima%20County,%20Arizona> (last accessed Dec. 29, 2019).

The District is also better than state averages for administrators: in 2019-20, African American administrators comprise 11.6 percent of the District total, while the average for the state is only 5.9 percent, and as noted above African Americans make up only about 4 percent of the Tucson area general population. [ECF 2329-1, p. 91.]

Over the last five years under the USP, while the District has employed the strategies outlined in the original Outreach, Recruitment and Retention Plan, the HR Procedures for Recruiting African American Professional Staff, and the strategies described below, the District has consistently hired a significant number of African American teachers and administrators each year:

African American Certified Teachers Staff Hiring

School Year	Classroom Teachers Hired			Other Certified Teachers Hired			Total Certified Teachers Hired		
	AA	Total	%	AA	Total	%	AA	Total	%
SY1516	20	505	4%	3	127	2%	23	632	4%
SY1617	39	1057	4%	9	185	5%	48	1242	4%
SY1718	22	495	4%	8	182	4%	30	677	4%
SY1819	32	616	5%	9	147	6%	41	763	5%
SY1920	19	462	4%	10	148	7%	29	610	5%

African American Administrator Hiring

School Year	Central Admin Hired			Site Admin Hired			All Admin Hired		
	AA	Total	%	AA	Total	%	AA	Total	%
SY1516	0	8	0%	2	16	13%	2	24	8%
SY1617	4	17	24%	6	46	13%	10	63	16%
SY1718	1	13	8%	5	36	14%	6	49	12%
SY1819	1	10	10%	6	40	15%	7	50	14%
SY1920	3	13	23%	2	23	9%	5	36	14%

II. Strategies and Issues.

A. Role of the Diversity Recruitment Director.

The Court directed the District to clarify the role of the Diversity Recruitment Director with regard to the HR Procedures for Recruiting African American Professional Staff. The Director of Diversity Recruitment and Inclusion Programs² is responsible for the design and implementation of the District's Diversity Plan, which includes within-school teacher and administrator diversity, and Grow Your Own programs for teachers and administrators of color. The Director is also responsible for effectively designing and implementing the District's efforts in the recruitment of racially/ethnically diverse, qualified individuals to fill vacancies across the academic and business-related functions, including the HR Procedures for Recruiting African American Professional Staff. Though this Director is responsible for implementation, the entire Human Resources Department as a whole undertakes responsibility for infusing these principles throughout the Department's activities, and energizing the strategies described herein for recruitment of African American and other professionals of color.

B. Consideration of a GYO Program with an HBCU.

As directed by the Court, the District has considered whether a Grow-Your-Own (GYO) program like the Arizona Teaching Fellows program can be developed in conjunction with an HBCU institution. This review began with the recognition that a grow-your-own program by its nature is focused on existing employees located in Tucson, and no HBCU institution is located here. Thus, a grow-your-own program with some distant educational institution must necessarily involve remote learning for the connection of its Tucson-based participants to the distant institution. In its review, the District did not find a similar program that could be conducted remotely from Tucson at any HBCU.

However, the District did find at least one program, Urban Teachers at John Hopkins University, that works with distant schools in Dallas, Texas. The program allows student teachers from John Hopkins to do their student teaching in Dallas and take online classes towards their master's degree. This program includes a component called the Black Educators Initiative which is geared towards African American individuals who are interested in teaching in urban settings (*see* <https://urbanteachers.org/the-black-educators-initiative-bei/>). While this program is not at an HBCU, the District will make

² This position was formerly known as the Director of Talent Acquisition, Recruitment and Retention. The name of the position has been changed to reflect the singular focus of this recruiting position on diversity and inclusion issues, rather than on recruiting generally.

efforts to engage with John Hopkins (or similar institutions) to expand this program to the District

C. Highlighted Strategies Uniquely Important to African American Recruiting.

Current research provides a variety of tools, marketing models, and frameworks for recruiting African American professional staff – many of which are already in use within the District (see **Att. 1**). As with student recruitment (see MORE Plan), the District differentiates Marketing (how to get the attention of African American candidates) and Outreach and Recruitment (how to get African American candidates interested in, applying to, and hired into the District).

1. General Strategies.

Strategic Advertising. Advertising designed to appeal to a specific demographic that the District is targeting for recruitment – in this case Black professional staff – that is strategically placed in locations where African American candidates are apt to see the ad, targeting websites and publications designed for people of color.

Strategic Partnerships and Presence. The District continues to work proactively to partner with African American teachers with high potential for leadership early in their careers and to provide opportunities for advancement. Though the District recognizes it has not had great success with recruiting directly with HBCUs, it also recognizes that strategic partnerships may prove fruitful in the future. The District will continue to target, collaborate, and partner with HBCUs that offer teacher education programs to maintain open lines of communication and convey our continued interest in hiring more African American teachers. The District will also reach out to John Hopkins to inquire about the Urban Teachers program for a potential future partnership.

Early Posting and Hiring/High-Touch Recruiting. The District works to conduct hiring earlier in the year as a strategy to recruit more diverse candidates. The District also seeks to prioritize and follow up with prospective applicants of color to build relationships and offer support.

Centralized Applicant Pool. The District maintains a centralized base of all applicants who have applied for positions. When new positions are posted, the District regularly contacts prior applicants of color (including African Americans) and encourages them to apply for the new position.

Grow Your Own / New Teacher Induction. The District collaborates with higher education institutions to incentivize non-certified staff to complete four-year degrees and to seek teaching certification through its GYO program. Several African American para-professionals have earned degrees and teaching positions through the help of these programs in the District. However, the District will continue to work encourage and support African American staff utilizing this resource in the future.

New Teacher Induction Program. The District implements an extensive new teacher induction program to support and retain African American teachers once hired. The District's NTIP includes a teacher mentor with a reduced caseload of one mentor for every ten first year teachers in many cases or, at most, a caseload of one mentor for every fifteen new teachers. Additional site-based sheltering strategies are made available to support first year teachers at racially concentrated or underperforming schools.

Leadership Prep Academy/Leadership Training. The District's Instructional Leadership Academy (ILA) provides training for school administrators so they can create work environments that encourage teachers of color to stay, and supports African American administrators who may be new administrators or new to Tucson to feel welcomed and supported. The District will continue to implement the Leadership Prep Academy (LPA) to identify African American professional staff with the potential for leadership.

2. Specific Strategies.

a. Stipends/Incentives

Recruitment Incentives for Critical Needs (Hard-to-Fill).

The District offers a recruitment incentive to new-to-the District incoming teachers in critical needs subject areas. The District has successfully used Hard to Fill incentives to recruit 7 African American teachers in SY 2016-17, 6 in SY 2017-18, 7 in SY2018-19, and 7 in SY 2019-20.

Make the Move.

The District offers the Make the Move program to provide financial assistance to employees with bachelor's degrees to use an alternate pathway to teacher certification. The District has successfully used these incentives for support of 2 African American teacher candidates in the SY 2016-17 cohort, 5 in SY 2017-18, 5 in SY2018-19, and 4 in SY 2019-20.

Relocation Expense Reimbursement.

The District utilizes this incentive to attract and retain talented and certificated African-American professional staff. This incentive is a one-time expense of up to \$10,000.00.

The Relocation Expense Reimbursement incentive may be offered to teachers and administrators that are new to the District and are moving to Arizona from out-of-state to work for the District. The District has successfully used this with three African American teachers (two in SY2018-19, and one in SY2019-20).

b. Immediate Assurance of Position

The District has developed procedures to offer potential candidates an immediate, on-the-spot assurance of a position, in appropriate circumstances, at the first contact with the candidate, such as at a job fair, an offsite interview, recruiting trip or other such occasion. The District has found that this improves chances of success in recruiting top candidates.³

c. Nationwide Recruiting

The goal is to increase the ethnic/racial diversity of the District's administrators and certificated staff, specifically African-Americans. This strategy includes maintaining relationships with placement departments and recruitment trips to identified HBCUs and other colleges and universities offering teacher preparation programs and enrolling diverse student populations in their education programs.

³ Consistent with Arizona law regarding teacher and administrator hiring all such offers must be subject to approval by the Governing Board.

Attachment 1

Report on HR Procedures for Recruiting African American Professional Staff

This report identifies recruitment tools and procedures for recruiting African American professional staff, marketing strategies to accomplish that recruiting, and a continuing commitment to ensure that relevant human resources staff¹ are trained in the use of such tools, procedures, and strategies.

Current research provides a variety of tools, marketing models, and frameworks for recruiting African American professional staff – many of which are already in use within TUSD. For this report, the District organizes these tools and models into two general areas of focus: marketing models and strategies and recruitment strategies.² We contextualize these three areas under two strategic questions: how to get the attention of African American candidates (marketing models and strategies); and how to get African American candidates interested in, applying to, and hired for our district (recruitment strategies)? For each strategy below, the District includes a review of its existing recruitment practices and procedures in relation to the cited, research-based, recruitment tools and models aimed at recruiting African American teachers and administrators.

1. Marketing Models and Strategies.

Current marketing tools, models, and strategies for recruiting African American professional staff are designed to capture the attention and interest of African American candidates to want to consider, and apply to, TUSD. These include strategic advertising, strategic partnerships and presence, and outreach.

a. Strategic Advertising.

A key research-based strategy is to develop strategic advertising, designed to appeal to the specific demographic that the District is targeting for recruitment – in this case, African American professional staff.³ TUSD monitors its progress in hiring and placing diverse

¹ Relevant staff are those involved in marketing, recruitment, and hiring.

² See Greenberg Motamedi, Jason and Stevens, David. (2018)(“Motamedi & Stevens”) *Human Resources Practices for Recruiting, Selecting, and Retaining Teachers of Color* (identifying a three-part HR practices framework for recruiting teachers of color: recruiting, selecting and hiring, and onboarding and retaining”). Available at: <https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/edlabs/regions/northwest/pdf/human-resources-practices.pdf>; see also Leong, Melinda, Greenberg Motamedi, Jason, and Young Yoon, Sun. (2018)(“Leong, Motamedi & Sun”). *Common Practices for Recruiting, Training, and Retaining Bilingual and Diverse Teachers* (outlining three broad areas school districts have used to achieve high rates of recruitment, preservice program completion, hiring, and retention of bilingual and diverse teachers. These areas include marketing strategies (outreach; collaborative partnerships) and recruitment strategies (social and emotional supports, inclusive admissions, responsive curriculum, teacher induction and mentoring, and professional learning). Available at <https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/edlabs/regions/northwest/pdf/common-bractices-bilingual.pdf>.

³ See Motamedi & Stevens (2018), suggesting districts “share information on job openings locally and across the country through social media, local news sources, town and district websites, career fairs, educator networks, institutions of higher education, etc.; and see Travis J. Bristol, Ph.D. (2015)(“Bristol”). *Recruiting and Retaining*

candidates and develops marketing materials and campaigns that target African American professionals, specifically, and highlight the many benefits of working at TUSD – including multicultural and culturally responsive working environments, New Teacher Induction, financial incentive opportunities (diversity incentives, magnet incentives, relocation stipend), and general benefits of living in Tucson/Southern Arizona.⁴ TUSD’s Human Resources department works with the Communications department as partners to create marketing materials, such as descriptive brochures, informative websites, and engaging videos (Leong, Motamedi, & Sun, 2018).

In an effort to reach African American candidates, TUSD advertises in places where African American candidates are apt to see the ad, targeting websites and publications designed for people of color. We ensure recruitment materials, websites, and job postings contain clear and consistent messaging about our commitment to diversity, inclusion, and non-discrimination. All job postings are mined specifically for opportunities to post on www.HBCUCareers.com and on websites of individual HBCUs via www.joinhandshake.com.

TUSD also advertises its Leadership Prep Academy, grow your own program (make the move), and teacher diversity stipend to current African American employees to encourage enrollment or participation. We have begun incorporating the teacher diversity stipend into our spring and fall equalization process and are working on internal marketing strategies that will allow us to better communicate our programs internally. These programs market to existing staff to improve intra-district diversity and to develop African American professional staff into African American administrators.

b. Strategic Partnerships and Presence.

To recruit teachers of color, the research literature suggests that districts should build relationships with faculty members and administrators from local and national institutions that enroll a diverse student body, including historically Black colleges and universities (HBCU) (Motamedi & Stevens, 2018). Districts can develop partnerships with local universities and teachers of color to actively recruit talented teachers into administrator preparation, especially those who have demonstrated a commitment to working in hard-to-staff schools.⁵

TUSD continues to work proactively to partner with African American teachers with high potential for leadership early in their careers and to provide opportunities for advancement. Though TUSD recognizes it has not had great success with recruiting directly with HBCUs, it also recognizes that strategic partnerships may prove fruitful in the future. The District will

Educators of Color, recommending districts enact “more robust marketing and recruitment strategies to actively pursue teachers of color.”

⁴ See *Id.*, finding that District’s that effectively recruit teachers of color use data to know who is underrepresented in the workforce and use this data “to create marketing campaigns that appeal to candidates of color, are specific to the position, and highlight the benefits the district has to offer.”

⁵ Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). *Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color*. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

continue to target, collaborate, and partner with HBCUs that offer teacher education programs to maintain open lines of communication and convey our continued interest in hiring more African American teachers.

The District engages other strategic partnerships such as with the National Alliance of African American School Educators (NASBE). TUSD representatives attend NASBE conference each year to network and connect with a diverse group of faculty and administrators with the specific goal of building relationships that will lead to future hires of African American professional staff.

Districts that effectively recruit teachers of color often leverage “connectors” to extend outreach beyond individual networks, including other teachers of color or other community members who can use their broader networks to help develop relationships with communities of color.⁶ TUSD will continue to work with institutions to strengthen relationships with the African American community (including the NAACP, Urban League, and the Interdenominational Ministerial Alliance). TUSD also partners with Tucson’s largest employers such as Davis-Monthan Air Force Base, Raytheon, and the University of Arizona to access broader networks for recruiting.

Districts should also consider partnering with universities to cultivate a pipeline for African American teachers and supporting African American staff members to finish four-year degrees in areas focused on education and to consider teaching certification (Bristol, 2015). TUSD maintains and is strengthening its relationship with the U of A to build relationships with students who may not be considering teaching currently, but who may be open to the idea if provided more information and connections to African American educators.

2. Recruitment Strategies Beyond Marketing and Outreach.

Recruitment strategies include those directed at moving potential candidates from interest to application to hiring. Several research-based strategies can improve the chances that interested applicants will actually apply; other strategies improve the likelihood these candidates will be hired and remain at TUSD.

a. Early Posting and Hiring.

Research shows that hiring earlier in the year can result in more racially diverse teacher hires.⁷ For the past few years, TUSD has moved its hiring timelines to begin at the start of second semester in the winter, rather than in the spring as it has in prior years.

⁶ Motamedi & Stevens (2018); finding that “Districts that effectively recruit teachers of color also engage in ongoing, relationship-based recruitment. Teachers of color may be considering higher-paying careers outside of teaching. To recruit teachers of color, the research literature suggests that districts may wish to build personal relationships with students of color at institutions of higher education. . . . Districts can form relationships during campus visits with potential candidates and through alumni calls to students, and they can invite candidates to school or district events to meet current teachers or educators with similar backgrounds.”

⁷ Carver-Thomas, D. (2018), *Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color*. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute, acknowledging a “report detailing the Boston Public Schools (BPS) Human

b. High-Touch Recruiting.

Another effective tool cited by research is the use of “high-touch recruiting methods” (Carver-Thomas, 2018). This method involves actively prioritizing and following up with prospective applicants of color, building relationships with them, and offering them support. This has the effect of bringing more candidates into the profession who might otherwise be discouraged from applying. The District has engaged in this practice for several years to ensure that diverse candidates feel welcome and understand that they are valued in TUSD.

c. Financial Incentives.

Research shows that districts should not only seek to use, but should broaden, financial incentives (Bristol, 2015). The District offers a diversity stipend which, based on data, is available to African American teaching applicants at a high rate because they often add to the diversity of a school by increasing the percentage of African American teachers *and* reducing the percentage of Anglo or Hispanic teachers where those percentages are disproportionately high. The District also offers a relocation stipend of up to \$3000 to encourage out of state candidates to apply.

d. Grow Your Own Programs (GYOPs).

Districts should work to intentionally offer opportunities for paraprofessionals to “upgrade their skills” (Bristol, 2015), and to utilize GYOPs to recruit teacher candidates from nontraditional populations who are more likely to reflect local diversity and are more likely to continue to teach in their communities. TUSD collaborates with higher education institutions to incentivize non-certified staff to complete four-year degrees and to seek teaching certification through its GYOP. Several African American para-professionals have earned degrees and teaching positions through the help of these programs in TUSD. However, the District will continue to work to strengthen the numbers of African American staff utilizing this resource in the future.

e. New Teacher Induction Program (NTIP).

Districts can offer comprehensive induction to support beginning teachers of color in their first years of teaching. Induction often includes being matched with a veteran mentor teacher and can also include seminars, classroom assistance, time to collaborate with other teachers, coaching and feedback from experienced teachers, and reduced workloads (Carver-Thomas, 2018). These programs often include a formal induction process that offers instructional coaching, mentoring, and peer support (Leong, Motamedi & Sun, 2018).

The District implements an extensive new teacher induction program to support and retain African American teachers once hired. TUSD’s NTIP includes a teacher mentor with a

Capital Initiative (HCI), a hiring policy change initiated in 2014, showed that initiating hiring timelines earlier in the year resulted in more racially diverse teacher hires.”

reduced caseload of one mentor for every ten first year teachers in many cases or, at most, a caseload of one mentor for every fifteen new teachers. Additional site-based sheltering strategies are made available to support first year teachers at racially concentrated or underperforming schools.

f. Leadership Training.

In-service leadership training can also make a difference in teacher retention (Carver-Thomas, 2018). TUSD's Instructional Leadership Academy (ILA) provides training for school administrators so they can create work environments that encourage teachers of color to stay, and supports African American administrators who may be new administrators or new to Tucson to feel welcomed and supported. The District will continue to implement the Leadership Prep Academy (LPA) to identify African American professional staff with the potential for leadership.

g. Culture and Climate.

To attract and retain African American professionals to teach and serve as administrators, the district as a whole must prioritize equity as a value and implement responsive curriculum (Bristol, 2015), and provide social and emotional supports for African American professionals (Leong, Motamedi & Sun, 2018). TUSD, more than most other districts nationwide, has developed and celebrated a culture and climate dedicated to diversity, equity, multiculturalism, culturally responsiveness, and inclusion. District staff highlight these values and priorities in every effort to convey to African American professional candidates the welcoming culture and climate that exists in TUSD. This is a core value and strategy in TUSD's recruitment efforts.

h. Pre-College Initiatives.

Pre-college initiatives (cadet programs) targeting high school students can be effective in developing African American teachers and future leaders (Bristol, 2015). The District has attempted to develop successful high-school-based GYOPs and will continue to examine this strategy as a long-term possibility for growing African American professional staff.

i. Ongoing Monitoring and Adjustment.

The research recommends ongoing monitoring for evidence-based accountability, planning, and assessment. The TUSD Recruitment and Retention Advisory Committee meets quarterly to monitor efforts, make adjustments, and seek out new practices. This committee aids the District in articulating a clear vision and goals for increasing the number of African American professionals by collaboratively creating an evidence-based plan that includes ongoing and comprehensive evaluation, with procedures for data collection, reflection, and refinement.