



TUCSON UNIFIED
SCHOOL DISTRICT

TWO-WAY DUAL LANGUAGE PROGRESS PROGRESS REPORT

Submitted by:

Rosa G. Molina, Executive Director

Association of Two-Way & Dual Language Education (ATDLE)

December 2019

TUSD Language Acquisition Department

Director Patricia Sandoval-Taylor

Progress Report

In 2016, Tucson Unified School District (TUSD) contracted with the Association of Two-Way & Dual Language Education (ATDLE) Executive Director Rosa G. Molina to conduct an extensive analysis of the Two-Way Dual Language (TWDL) programs in ten TUSD schools. ATDLE created a TWDL Program Review and Report (2016 Molina Report), including a list of recommendations for both immediate attention to its programs and for work that needed to span over the course of the next three years. The key components outlined for the TWDL programs in the District met both researched-based principles and were reflective of best practices in Two-Way Bilingual Immersion (TWBI) programming¹.

Over the course of the past three years, ATDLE worked closely with the assistant superintendents, the Language Acquisition Department team, the TWDL school principals, the TWDL teaching staff at both the elementary and secondary levels and various department heads to realign their work to the basic tenets of TWDL programs. Through this progress report process, we examined and collected evidence that TUSD has implemented all of the recommendations from the first report and completed most of them.

After multiple meetings with the LAD team, I was able to analyze TUSD's progress on all aspects of these recommendations before submitting this report to the Court's request for an update. The following list of twenty-two recommendations and the progress to date are described below. Section A reports on progress for twelve (12) of the recommendations related to TWDL Program implementation. Section B reports on ten (10) of the recommendations related to the TWDL program expansion.

¹ In this report, the terms "Two-Way Dual Language" (TWDL) and "Two-Way Bilingual Immersion" (TWBI) are used interchangeably to mean an instructional program that develops bilingualism and biliteracy in two languages by integrating native English speakers and native speakers of another language (here, Spanish).

A. Status of 2016 Implementation Recommended Actions (12 Recommendations)**Recommendation 1: District Program Framework**

Develop a comprehensive District Master Plan for Two-Way & Dual Programs. (2016 Report, p. 20)

In the school year, 2016-17, TUSD formed a TWDL Task Force for the express purpose of developing a TWDL Framework to guide the implementation of its programs. The task force comprised of LAD specialists, District level administrators, site administrators, teachers, parents, University of Arizona liaisons, and community members worked under the direction of ATDLE for six months to write and develop the TWDL District Framework. The different aspects of this work included:

- Reviewing the USP order to build and expand dual language programming in TUSD
- Familiarizing all members with the *Guiding Principles of Dual Language Education* and current research on dual language education
- Aligning the dual language program goals with the mission and vision of the TUSD
- Documenting program history
- Identifying and documenting the rationale and benefits of Two-Way Dual Language programs for the TUSD community
- Outlining the program elements, developing the K-12 program pathways, identifying curriculum and assessments for progress monitoring
- Outlining the professional development plan for training new and existing Dual Language teachers and administrators
- Developing a parent engagement component to inform and recruit families into the program.

After completing the TWDL Framework, the Language Acquisition Department worked in collaboration with various TUSD department heads to ensure the successful implementation of the framework. The plan was reviewed by Superintendent Gabriel Trujillo, PhD., shared with members of the district leadership, all TWDL principals and teachers, and community representatives from the TWDL Task Force. The framework is posted on the district's website for public access.

Recommendation 2: Waiver for TWDL Programs

Seek a waiver for native Spanish-speaking students to participate in TWDL programs. (2016 Report, p. 20)

In 2017-18, TUSD approached the AZ State Department proposing an alternate model for the TWDL program to linguistically balance their TWDL classrooms. TUSD's request to the State Board of Education was denied because the State Board, albeit receptive and responsive, had to adhere to state law Proposition 203. Based on continued advocacy, new legislation SB 1014, was filed and on January 2018, SB 1014 provided some flexibility within the 4-hour SEI model. The District continued advocacy to allow ELs at Kindergarten into TWDL classrooms in an effort to linguistically balance classes for the 2018-19 school year. TUSD received a guidance document from the AZ Department of Education regarding the use of an alternative assessment to qualify kindergarteners for a Bilingual Waiver Type 1. An *alternative assessment* for incoming kindergarten Spanish speaking students was approved and moved TUSD into careful monitoring of the language levels of incoming Spanish-speaking kindergarteners to determine their participation in a TWDL program while continuing to adhere to AZ State mandates. In 2018-19, the standard for language proficiency and qualifications for the Type I Bilingual Waiver were modified from an *oral language proficiency* standard to an *oral intermediate proficiency* standard on the AZELLA. This is allowing TUSD to include more Spanish-speaking students to enter the TWDL program at the primary level.

Recommendation 3: Handbook for TWDL Programs

Update the current Two-Way Dual Language Program Practice Handbook and align it to the Guiding Principles for Dual Language Education (Center for Applied Linguistics)

Over the course of the 2017-19 school years, TWDL site administrators and constituents from their TWDL teams worked with ATDLE to create their TWDL handbooks to share with their staff, parents and the community at large. The handbooks included background information on the program model at the school, list of parent meetings and parent engagement activities in full support of the academic and cultural activities at their school. Specific program components that include staffing information are outlined in the program handbooks in an effort to connect parents to the TWDL teachers and leadership at the school. The handbooks focus on several of the *Guiding Principles for Dual Language*: Program Structure, Parent Engagement, Instruction, Curriculum and Assessments. Handbooks are posted in the TWDL Principals' Shared Space; each school is asked to update and post to their website annually once translations are complete.

Recommendation 4: Yearly Calendar for Professional Training

Establish a yearly calendar with targeted professional training for Two-Way Dual Language teachers and administrators.

ATDLE confers with the LAD team to establish a yearly calendar with targeted professional training for the TWDL administrators and teachers. These professional trainings are organized and directed by the LAD team and identified in the TUSD Two-Way Dual Language Framework. The professional development outlined in the framework serves as the roadmap for all professional training activities. The professional development is tiered to meet the needs of new teachers and administrators in TWDL and the veteran teachers who have taught in the program for several years.

The initial trainings re-focused the teachers and administrators on the fundamental components of TWDL instruction and has evolved into improved and effective teaching practices to include Spanish Writing K-8, creating a language rich learning environment through GLAD (Guided Language Acquisition by Design) strategies, and scaffolding strategies to make instruction comprehensible for second language learning. The 2018-19 trainings consisted of the lesson planning that incorporates the essential elements for learning language through content such as SIOP (Sheltered Instruction Observation Protocol) during the Spanish portion of the day. The 2019-20 professional training focus is familiarizing teachers with the newly adopted curriculum within a TWDL classrooms and the careful planning of the Spanish and English language arts instruction.

Recommendation 4: TWDL Teacher Stipend

Connect the TWDL teacher stipend to completion of professional training for all Two-Way and Dual Language teachers.

The Director LAD worked with the Human Resources Department to outline the TWDL Professional Training stipend afforded to the TWDL teachers who actively participate in annual professional development in-services and workshops prioritized by the District each year. The stipend is also tied to training but allows TUSD to recruit and retain teachers into the TWDL workforce. The conditions for acquiring this stipend is stipulated on the HR website. HR monitors the distribution of the stipends. TUSD continues to refine the process for distributing and monitoring this funding.

Recommendation 5: TWDL Program Evaluation Plan

Create an Evaluation Plan (aka Assessment Framework) for all TWDL programs to include assessments in the target language in all four domains: listening, speaking, reading, and writing.

An assessment framework to monitor students' progress in both languages was developed as part of the TWDL Program Framework and reviewed each school year as new assessments and initiatives come forward. The Assessment framework can be found in the TUSD Assessment Resource Page. TWDL principals review the assessment requirements annually as part of the beginning of the year TWDL Principals' Meetings.

Recommendation 6: Programmatic Pathway

Develop a programmatic pathway to be shared with teachers, administrators, parents (present and prospective) and students.

The LAD and the TWDL Task Force created the K-12 TWDL Program Pathway to inform the TWDL students and families of the elementary programs, middle school options, and high school programs available to their students. These pathways are a continued work in progress as the district determines the feeder patterns for each of its elementary TWDL programs.

Recommendation 8: Enrollment Policy

Establish an enrollment policy that outlines the point of entry into TWDL classrooms after kindergarten and defines the screening process for students interested in entering after K-1st grades by July 2016.

An enrollment policy was developed and incorporated into the TWDL Program Framework. This policy included the requirements for parents to attend informational meetings, establishing point of entry into the program, and the criteria for late enrollees including a program screener into any TWDL program after first grade. This policy was shared formally with the TUSD School and Community services administrators and continues to be discussed annually with this team.

Recommendation 9: Program Assessment Using Guiding Principles

Have all existing TWDL programs conduct a Program Assessment using the Guiding

Principles for Dual Language programs and use the data findings to realign the program at each site by September – November 2016.

An initial programmatic assessment using the rubrics from the *Guiding Principles of Dual Language* allowed the LAD team and consultant to analyze the level of readiness and understanding of the elements of TWDL programs by the leadership at each school. This assessment took place in September 2016 and became the springboard for the realignment work of all TWDL programs in TUSD. The site administrator also assessed their TWDL programs using various instruments, which prompted them to design their goals for the upcoming year.

I was able to meet with all site principals and site leaders over the course of the past three years for professional in-service, data chats and goal-setting sessions. During these meetings, the fundamentals of Dual Language programs and research were presented, data findings for their students were shared and discussed, and each school committed to defining their areas of focus for each school year.

All site administrators and TWDL teachers were introduced to the *TWBI Environmental Checklist* as a starting point for creating classroom environments designed for first and second language development. A series of walkthroughs of all TWDL classrooms in all seven TWDL schools was conducted with debriefing sessions with the principals and teachers as a critical component of their professional development sessions.

In addition to the above, LAD organized trips to exemplary TWDL programs with teams of teachers and administrators to observe best practices. Teams of teachers were sent to the annual National TWBI Conference in California and Nevada to work with master teachers and TWDL administrators as part of their professional development training. The teams were asked to debrief these sessions in order to continue the program develop in their respective schools. The LAD team worked with the TUSD's Instructional Technology team to "tagged" all TWDL students into the district's student accountability system in an effort to monitor the progress of the students in both languages.

Dr. Kathryn Lindholm-Leary, Professor Emeritus from San José State University in San José, California (the leading researcher in TWDL educational programs) organized the data sets in both English and Spanish. She shared her analysis of the progress of the

students in both languages with the LAD team, the area superintendents, site principals, and coaches, in an effort to inform each level about the progress of the students in both languages.

Recommendation 10: Two-Classroom Strand Structure

Review the enrollment at each site and begin to design a two-classroom TWDL structure to reduce programmatic isolation of the TWDL classes at the site and make the program accessible to additional students September –December 2016

The Two-Way Dual Language program at TUSD is offered to parents as a **program choice** at the elementary level allowing families the opportunity to help their children develop bilingual and biliteracy proficiencies over the course of their K-8th grade schooling experience. TWBI programs throughout the United States are created to help ethnically balance a school through the vehicle of second language opportunities for all students.

“Student integration is central to TWI programs for sociocultural and linguistic reasons. Student integration contributes to the development of positive intergroup relationships between language minority and language majority students. It can break down stereotypes and develop positive attitudes towards both languages and language groups. (Howard, 2003; Lambert & Cazabon, 1994; Lindholm 1994; Lindholm-Leary & Borsato, 2001).

In the Order, the Court confuses my description of program isolation to mean the “racial isolation” of students. My intent in this recommendation was to suggest to TUSD that additional classes per grade level upon entry in kindergarten (double strands) has great benefit to building stronger program cohorts, programmatic flexibility, and prevents schools from confining students into the same single class cohorts from kindergarten to 8th grades. In other words, double strands would protect against cohort isolation (aka program isolation). **My references to cohort or program isolation were not directed towards racial or ethnic isolation of students.**

Five TUSD schools working with TWDL programming, with the exception of Davis Bilingual Magnet, Roskruge Bilingual Magnet, Hollinger K-8, Bloom Elementary and McCorkle, are single strand programs within schools. Again, the lack of additional classes at each grade level means that students stay with the same cohort of students through the grade levels and that teachers do not have partner teachers to plan their program with. When a program has at least two classes and teachers per grade level, the two dual language teachers are able to team to plan their TWDL grade level

curriculum and subjects, exchange for language instruction at K-2, plan special projects, and review the progress of their students. The goal is to prevent the classrooms and classroom teachers at a particular grade level from programmatic isolation.

Recommendation 11: TWDL Program Curricula

Identify a coherent and differentiated Two-Way Dual Language Program Curricula by September – June 2017.

In 2018 school year, the LAD team along with the Curriculum and Instruction Department led the TUSD's yearlong curriculum adoption process to vet and evaluate English and Spanish Language curriculum and materials. The process for new curriculum adoption is clearly outlined by TUSD School Board of Education and must be closely adhered to. This process was conducted from November 2018-July 2019 in preparation for a new Language Arts adoption in the fall of 2019. The different language arts programs submitted were publicly reviewed with the submittals from different vendors who responded to the TUSD Request for Proposals by the District. A district committee was formed to ensure that all publishers met all of the criteria set forth for adoption. The committee vetted all of the materials from the publishers who met the district criteria using an extensive assessment protocol. Those remaining publishers were sent out for public review for 90 days and teachers, parents, and community members were able to review the core materials for both English Language Arts, Spanish Language Arts and English Language Development and participated in the presentations by the vendors explaining all of the components of the program for their respective materials.

Recommendation 12: TWDL Advisory Committee

Create a District level Two-Way Dual Language Program Committee to oversee the implementation of all programs in TUSD

In school 2017-18, the Task Force comprised of LAD specialist, District level administrators, site administrators, teachers, parents and community members worked under the direction of the ATDLE expert consultant to develop the TWDL District Framework. Preparation for the task of creating the TWDL Framework included:

- reviewing the USP order to build and expand dual language
- familiarizing all members with Guiding Principles of Dual Language Education and current research on dual language education
- aligning the dual language program goals with the mission and vision of the District
- documenting program history

-
- Identifying and documenting the rationale and benefits of Two-Way Dual Language in TUSD community
 - Outline program elements, curriculum and assessment
 - Outline the professional development plan for training new and existing Dual Language teachers and administrators

After establishing the essential criteria and creating the framework, the Language Acquisition Department worked in collaboration with various District departments to ensure implementation. During school year 2019-20, the District will establish the Two-Way Dual Language Advisory Committee to oversee the implementation of the dual language programs in the District. The Advisory Committee will include members of the Task Force as well as additional District level members, site level members, parents and community members.

B. Status of 2016 Expansion Recommended Actions (10 Recommendations)**Recommendation 13**

Consider expansion to new District neighborhood schools for the 2016-17 school year

The District sought to expand Two-Way Dual Language at the following sites for the purpose of supporting integration based on the recommendation from the Coordinated Student Assignment committee (CSA):

- Bloom
- Marshall
- Dietz
- Davidson
- Roberts-Naylor

Members of the Language Acquisition Department along with the District TWDL expert met with site administrators to begin the process of identifying a viable site for expansion. The TUSD Two-Way Technical Report provided by the District TWDL expert summarizes the results of those meetings. After reviewing the demographics, integration potential, administrative support, staffing and physical space of each site, Bloom was then identified as the most viable site for expansion.

Due to budgetary constraints, the District chose to best use its resources to strengthen existing programs as a long-term viable solution (see TUSD Expansion Plan).

Recommendation 14: Community Interest Survey

Conduct a Community Interest Survey of preschool and parents of 4 and 5 year old students before establishing a new program at any school.

Bloom Elementary was selected as the newest Dual Language program after careful consideration of the school's readiness to add a new program to its offerings. A Parent Interest Survey along with parent informational meetings were held during the initial stages of program development at Bloom Elementary.

Recommendation 15: New TWDL Classes

Work with a school to create the new TWDL classes at the proposed schools and establish the busing and program components necessary for the program to be successful by January 2016.

After reviewing the demographics, integration potential, administrative support, staffing and physical space of each site, Bloom Elementary was then identified as the most viable site for expansion. Classes from Kindergarten to Third grade are currently in place with plans to develop the intermediate grade levels for the TWDL students.

Due to budgetary constraints, the District chose to best use its resources to strengthen existing programs as a long-term viable solution.

Recommendation 16: Identifying Prospective Staff

Conduct a district survey to identify staff for future TWDL programs and identify bilingual certified staff in the TUSD.

and

Recommendation 17: *Invite prospective TWDL teachers to an informational meeting to explain the TWDL program design and its requirements.*

The LAD leadership worked with human resources to identify all bilingual endorsed teachers in the District. Teachers in the District with bilingual endorsements were invited to a Two-Way Dual Language Recruitment event (informational meeting). During this event, LAD coordinated with all 11 TWDL site administrators, the University of Arizona College of Education teacher preparation program and Human Resources.

Those in attendance received information on the Two-Way Dual Language program in TUSD, met with site administrators from the TWDL schools, and had the opportunity to connect and many times interview with the principals that had vacancies at their schools. Successful and viable candidates were given the opportunity to work directly with HR and receive offer *Letters of Intent to Hire* to fill current and future vacancies.

The LAD also coordinates the *Make the Move* Program with Human Resources. This program offers tuition reimbursement to teachers in the Tucson Unified School District fluent in Spanish interested in taking the required course work to receive their full bilingual endorsement in order to move into a designated dual language classroom. The

LAD team also established a partnership with the University of Arizona. The university offers tuition reduction to cohorts of teachers participating in the *Make the Move* program working toward their full bilingual endorsement.

The above recruitment efforts along with the stipend for recruitment and retention, has had a positive impact on vacancies. For the 2019-20 SY, all TWDL classrooms had teachers that were fully credentialed or in a program to complete their credentialing process.

Recommendation 18: Marketing Materials

Create marketing materials for each new site by January 2017

In 2016-17, LAD worked with the schools to create marketing presentations in an effort to standardize and educate the parents about the salient features of a Two-Way Dual Language programs. TUSD is committed to ensuring that parents have enough information to make an informed decision when selecting the program for their child. Administrators used this presentation as a template and added information specific to their site in order to customize presentations for their parent informational meetings. In 2017-18, LAD worked with the TUSD Communications department to create program logos, banners and brochures to market the TWDL programs at each site. In the 2019-20 school year, the TWDL schools have been asked to calendar a minimum of four parent information meetings in December and January to recruit new parents into the program. Schools will focus on ethnically and linguistically balancing their programs.

Recommendation 19: Professional Development for Teachers and Administrators

Provide teachers and administrators training and support in the initial development of their Two-Way Dual Language programs by April – August 2017.

TWDL educators engage in regional and local trainings and professional development to build both their teaching methodology and their repertoire of skills necessary to effectively teach in a second language setting. Below is a list of professional inservices and training that organizes the training in tiers for novice and experienced classroom teachers, lead teachers and administrators working TWDL settings.

It is the expectation of the District that the TUSD TWDL program staff members participate in focused professional development in an effort to continuously build both methodology and pedagogical understanding of their respective grade levels. The

following training structure is designed to keep teachers focused on the specific instructional components that comprise an effective TWDL teacher's teaching toolbox of strategies & methodologies:

Tier One:

- Two-Way Bilingual Immersion Theory and Framework- An Overview
- FLOSEM Calibration- overview and training
- Curriculum Trainings- New Adoption/curriculums
- Using grade level standards for instruction in both languages
- Literacy Development in two languages- reading and writing
- Teaching AELD in the TWDL classroom
- Data Management Systems- following academic progress in both languages
- Conversational Management Strategies- oral language development

Tier Two:

- Literacy Strategies: Guided Reading, Shared Reading and Writing, Literacy Workstations, Phonemic Awareness
- Development of Oral Language Proficiencies in both languages
- Using data to inform instruction
- Curriculum Mapping and Unit Planning
- Integration of technology to meet State and District standards in both languages

Tier Three:

- SIOP- Sheltered Instruction
- GLAD - Guided Language Acquisition Development
- Standards-based Unit Planning

Along with the tiered professional development plan, the LAD provided and continues to offer site administrators and classroom teachers opportunities to participate in national conferences focused on Two-Way Dual Language programming and opportunities to visit and observe exemplary Dual Language schools.

Recommendation 20: Visitations to Exemplary TWBI Programs

Set up visitations to districts and programs that have fully developed programs, ie. Alicia Chacon Multilingual School in Ysleta School District, El Paso, Texas; Nestor School in South Bay School District in the San Diego area by October – December 2017.

Over the course of the past three years, approximately 90 Tucson Unified TWDL teachers and administrators visited fully implemented TWBI programs in San Diego and Fresno, CA. The TWBI principals and staff from those schools hosted the TUSD visitors and described all aspects of their TWBI programs. They shared their progress monitoring systems of student achievement in both languages and allowed TUSD staff to visit their TWBI classrooms to observe best practices. Each visit was followed by a debriefing session where school representatives discuss their observations for the day and develop a plan to incorporate some of the observed best practices into their work.

Recommendation 21: TWDL Conference (Initial Professional Learning)

Send the new principal and the kindergarten teachers to this year's National Two-Way Bilingual Immersion Conference, June 27-29, 2016 in Palm Springs, CA to allow the new team at Bloom and the other schools considering the program to study, learn and network with Two-Way program experts and educators.

The new TWBI Program personnel from Bloom School attended the 2016 National TWBI Conference in Palm Springs as they prepared to open their program in the Fall of 2016. The prospective teachers and principal attended new program sessions, networked with existing programs and spoke with TWBI Master teachers and administrators during the course of the conference.

Recommendation 22: TWDL Conference (Ongoing Professional Learning)

Plan to send additional teams to the national conference each year in California to ensure that all new principals and teachers have received foundational training in TWDL educational practices and schooling.

Over the last four years, over 200 teachers and administrators registered and attended the National Two-Way Bilingual Immersion Conferences in California and Nevada. The district worked to include the TUSD teachers into the national network of TWBI programs and provide explicit professional training to administrators and classroom teachers who are working in TWDL settings. The TUSD had access to over 45 sessions a year to work through the program elements at the primary, intermediate, middle and high school programs.

C. Summary

Two-Way Dual Language schooling brings a radical transformation to the schooling of minority and majority student populations when the programs are implemented with fidelity, with knowledgeable leadership and highly skilled teachers. The research is overwhelming clear that receiving schooling through two languages is a powerful 21st century innovation in education. Students of all ethnic backgrounds and socioeconomic classes outscore their peers in non-TWBI programs. (Lindholm-Leary 2001, Thomas Collier 2016, Genesee & Howard 1995. The two most important outcomes are higher cognitive development in two languages and stronger student engagement in schooling. It addresses the challenging issues of performance gaps in minority students and equal protection under the law for all students by serving formerly underserved students with a rigorous and well-defined educational program option.

The Tucson Unified School district departments under the leadership from the Language Acquisition Department team, the TWDL school principals and area Superintendents, and working in close collaboration with the TUSD legal team, made great progress toward achieving the recommendations set out by the 2016 TWDL Program Molina Report. TUSD built a strong professional plan to build the capacity of the school leaders and the TWDL teachers. They completed a TWDL Program Framework to serve as the roadmap for the present and future development of these programs. They worked on establishing policies for staffing, enrollment, student monitoring, parent engagement, marketing, community outreach, etc. Very importantly, the team developed a clear understanding that oversight of these programs is an integral component to ensuring successful practices.

The teaching staff and school site administrators must continue to build their expertise as TWDL educators and offset the past vestiges of misinformed practices and policies. TUSD is building momentum in TWDL schooling for students and understands the need to grow these programs into the secondary level to allow students to fully attain the goals of academic achievement, biliteracy, and the development of cross-cultural proficiencies as outlined by this program.