# **EXHIBIT** A

#### Reading Recovery/Reading Support Status Report Supplement

#### A. <u>Multi-Tiered System of Supports</u>

The District operates a multi-tiered system of supports (MTSS) as the overarching process for identifying students in need, providing interventions, and monitoring and adjusting support. MTSS includes three tiers: Tier 1 (regular classroom instruction), Tier 2 (classroom or pull out interventions), and Tier 3 (pull-out interventions, which can be one-on-one or small group). The school's MTSS team is the primary mechanism for making these identifications, discussing individual students' needs on a frequent basis, and matching need with support and intervention.

All students receive Tier 1 classroom instruction. When students do not make adequate progress through Tier 1 instruction (according to the teacher, through assessments – like DIBELS or benchmarks, or by the MTSS team), they are identified for additional support through Tier 2 methods. Tier 2 interventions most often occur in small groups in the classroom, but can also occur through pull-out services. When students are not making adequate progress in Tier 2 interventions, they are provided intense Tier 3 support.

The principal assessment tool used in kindergarten is the DIBELS reading assessment. Students receiving a "Strategic" or "Intensive" assessment on the end-of year Kindergarten DIBELS assessment are preliminarily identified as needing Tier 2 reading intervention. Because of student mobility, student's reading loss or gain over the summer, and other factors, the District does not rely solely on DIBELS testing for identification of students needing additional reading support. After a more comprehensive evaluation of a student's reading progress in which DIBELS assessment is only one factor, and which may include lack of satisfactory progress with Tier 2 intervention, a portion of these students may be classified as needing a Tier 3 intervention such as Reading Recovery®. Thus, receiving a "Strategic" or "Intensive" assessment on the end-of-year Kindergarten DIBELS assessment does not, without more, mean that a student "needs" a Tier 3 reading intervention such as Reading Recovery®.

Under the MTSS system, the expectation is that approximately 5% of any student population will need Tier 3 interventions. Thus, for planning purposes, of the 3,245 kindergarten students who took the end-of-year DIBELS assessment in the spring of 2019, approximately 5%, or 163, of those students may be expected to need a Tier 3 reading intervention such as Reading Recovery® in first grade.

#### B. Reading Recovery®

Reading Recovery® refers only to a specific, Tier 3 intervention involving one half-hour session per day of one-on-one instruction for 12-20 weeks with a teacher trained in the specific Reading Recovery® pedagogical methods, using approved teaching materials. It is designed for the lowest achieving students as assessed using the *Observation Survey of Early Literacy Achievement (OS)*, the authorized Reading Recovery® assessment tool.

The Reading Recovery® standards indicate that one Reading Recovery®-trained teacher can serve four to six students at a time and up to twelve students per year.¹ The Reading Recovery® intervention lasts 12-20 weeks, and thus teachers can generally teach two rounds of interventions per year. There is no overlap of students from one session to the next. If a student does not reach grade level reading by the end of 20 weeks in Reading Recovery®, the student does not continue on in Reading Recovery® for another session, but rather is evaluated either for another intervention or for referral to exceptional education. Thus, if the intent is to serve <u>all</u> students in need of Tier 3 intervention with the Reading Recovery® intervention (as opposed to other Tier 3 interventions), the total number of Reading Recovery® teachers needed would be 14 if all taught at maximum capacity.

In reality, (a) not all first grade students needing Tier 3 interventions are African-American or Hispanic, (b) it is not always logistically possible to schedule delivery of Reading Recovery® at maximum capacity, and (b) the District has other Tier 3 reading interventions in addition to Reading Recovery®, including small group instruction by Reading Recovery® teachers, or one-on-one or group sessions with reading intervention specialists (there will be 15 of these throughout the District starting second semester of SY2019-20), or more intensive use of other intervention tools.

Reading Recovery® staff uses specialized criteria to select first grade African American and Hispanic students for Reading Recovery® (for more details, see ECF 2289-2 at 2-3). In August, Reading Recovery® staff visited classrooms and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Although these are generally the accepted limits for delivery of Reading Recovery®, the standards recognize that this number does not represent a full-time teaching load, and thus permit Reading Recovery® teachers to provide other reading instructional supports and interventions to as many as forty other students. Accordingly, Reading Recovery® teachers in the District also provide small group reading interventions (either Tier 2 or Tier 3, depending on the circumstance), which the District has called "indirect" Reading Recovery, as those group interventions may use some of the methods and materials of the formal Reading Recovery® one-on-one intervention.

collaborated with first grade teachers to identify 52 African American and Hispanic first grade students for direct services in targeted schools. For second semester, staff will identify 68 new first grade students the same way – adding 16 additional Tier 3 students.

Thus, approximately 120 African American and Hispanic first graders needing Tier 3 reading support receive that Tier 3 support through Reading Recovery® and the rest receive it through other Tier 3 interventions, including group interventions with Reading Recovery® teachers and reading intervention specialists.

### C. <u>Providing Supplemental Reading Support for Identified Students</u>

Within the Multi-Tiered System of Supports (MTSS), the District implements a comprehensive literacy framework to support reading at all elementary schools and K-8 schools. The framework includes Tier I programs and strategies to be used by classroom teachers as a baseline for reading instruction at a minimum of 90 minutes per day. All students receive this fundamental, base-level of support. Regardless of DIBELS assessment as "intensive" or "strategic," every first grade student receives a base-level of reading support.

Schools focus next on providing Tier 2 supplemental reading support to students identified as not making adequate progress in Tier 1 instruction. Within the District's literacy framework, SuccessMaker® is the primary Tier 2 program for supplemental reading support as it has been shown by research to have a statistically significant and positive effect on student outcomes for kindergarten and first grade in diverse student samples. When a student is identified for additional Tier 2 support, they receive an additional twenty minutes per day, four days per week of SuccessMaker® interventions. The District also provides an additional supplemental reading support program, Scholastic Bookroom/Guided Reading. Scholastic can be used in Tier 1 or Tier 2, but in Tier 2 the small group instruction requires a qualified staff member to deliver the additional support. These Tier 2 interventions are generally provided in the classroom, by the regular teacher, and thus need no extra staffing for delivery. In some targeted schools, Tier 2 support is provided in-class in a group setting by Reading Recovery® teachers, during times when they are not involved in providing their Tier 3 Reading Recovery interventions.<sup>2</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> In rare cases, schools elect to use alternative research-based programs, like Imagine Learning, based on a variety of factors including student make-up, teacher experience and ability, and availability of resources.

When students continue through Tier 2 interventions and are still not making adequate progress, the MTSS team or other relevant staff match the student with a Tier 3 intervention. In targeted schools, for African American and Hispanic first graders, this may lead to placement in Reading Recovery<sup>®</sup>. In other schools and at other grades, this may mean an additional thirty minutes per day, five days per week of SuccessMaker<sup>®</sup> intervention.

This comprehensive, literacy framework ensures that *every student* identified for supplemental Tier 2 or Tier 3 reading support will receive such support and, through the MTSS system, their progress will be monitored and adjusted as needed.

Reading Support Program	African American and Hispanic Students Receiving "Intensive" or "Strategic" Support DIBELS Assessments <sup>4</sup>
Students Needing Tier 3 Interventions:	
Reading Recovery®	120
RR/reading intervention specialists/other	20
Students Needing Tier 2 Interventions:	
SuccessMaker®/Other	540
RR teachers ("indirect")	120
Total	800

Within the financial and human resources available, the District provides supplemental reading support to every identified student utilizing research-based programs that include Reading Recovery®, SuccessMaker®, Scholastic Guided Reading® and Imagine Learning®.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Even when a student is in Reading Recovery<sup>®</sup>, schools may also provide other Tier 3 interventions such as Guided Reading, small group pull out, Reading Interventionist, SuccessMaker<sup>®</sup>, etc.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> All numbers are approximate - students move in and out of schools on a daily basis, and move from "Intensive" to "Strategic," and from "Strategic" to "Core" on a weekly or monthly basis. Thus, these numbers are approximate as they represent a moving target.

# EXHIBIT 1

### Case 4:74-cv-00090-DCB Document 2388-1 Filed 12/04/19 Page 7 of 8 End of Year 2018-19 DIBELS KINDERGARTEN ASSESSMENT

2018-19 KG Dibels Support Level (count)			2018-19 KG	2018-19 KG Dibels Support Level (count)				
School	USP Eth	Intensive	Strategic	School	<b>USP Eth</b>	Intensive	Strategic	
Banks ——	AfAm	0	0	Hallada	AfAm	1	2	
	Hisp	6	5	Holladay	Hisp	9	8	
Blenman AfAm Hisp	· ·	4	1		AfAm	1	0	
	Hisp	8	2	Hollinger	Hisp	23	11	
Bloom AfAm		3	0		AfAm	2	1	
	Hisp	12	5	Howell	Hisp	4	2	
	AfAm	2	3		AfAm	2	3	
Bonillas ——	Hisp	11	11	Hudlow	Hisp	11	3	
					AfAm			
Borman —	AfAm	0	3	Hughes		0	0	
	Hisp	1	0		Hisp	3	5	
Borton Hi	AfAm	3	1	Johnson	AfAm	1	0	
	Hisp	9	12		Hisp	6	3	
Carrillo —	AfAm	2	0	Kellond	AfAm	2	5	
	Hisp	7	3		Hisp	6	9	
Cavett AfAm Hisp	AfAm	2	2	Lineweaver	AfAm	1	0	
	Hisp	15	9	Lineweaver	Hisp	1	2	
Collier AfAm	AfAm	0	1	Lymp/Hravidos	AfAm	1	0	
	Hisp	0	0	Lynn/Urquides	Hisp	26	13	
Cragin AfAm		1	1		AfAm	1	0	
	Hisp	3	3	Maldonado	Hisp	7	5	
Davidson AfAm		1	3		AfAm	2	0	
	Hisp	9	5	Manzo	Hisp	18	12	
Davis Af <i>A</i>	AfAm	3	0		AfAm	1	0	
		28	4	Marshall	Hisp	4	4	
	AfAm	4	2	McCorkle	AfAm	1	0	
Dietz		8	3	PreK-8			_	
	Hisp		<b>.</b>	Prek-8	Hisp	20	14	
Drachman AfAn Hisp		1	0	Miles - E. L. C.	AfAm	0	0	
		10	4		Hisp	3	1	
Dunham AfAn Hisp		0	0	Miller	AfAm	0	0	
	· ·	5	4		Hisp	16	14	
Erickson AfAm Hisp		10	0	Mission View	AfAm	1	0	
		13	7		Hisp	6	5	
Fickett AfAm Hisp	AfAm	0	1	Morgan	AfAm	0	1	
	Hisp	2	5	Maxwell	Hisp	6	1	
Ford AfAm Hisp	AfAm	1	0	Myers-Ganoung	AfAm	2	2	
	Hisp	1	3	- Iviyers-Garioung	Hisp	3	1	
Fruchthendler Af/	AfAm	0	1	A. 1	AfAm	0	0	
	Hisp	0	0	Naylor	Hisp	4	2	
Gale	AfAm	0	0		AfAm	0	0	
	Hisp	2	3	Ochoa	Hisp	4	3	
Grijalya A	AfAm	1	0		AfAm	0	0	
	Hisp	39	18	Oyama	Hisp	3	10	
	AfAm	1	2		AfAm	0	0	
Henry				Pueblo Gardens			•	
	Hisp	3	3		Hisp	5	6	

School	USP Eth	Intensive	Strategic			
3011001	AfAm	0	1			
Robins <b>–</b>	Hisp	4	7	TOTALS	Intensive	Strategic
	AfAm	3	1	TOTALS	litterisive	Strategic
Robison	Hisp	10	13	AF AMERICAN	79	53
Rose	AfAm	0	0	AF AIVIERICAIN	/9	33
	Hisp	11	11	HISPANIC	544	357
Pockrugo	AfAm			HISPANIC	344	337
Roskruge		0	0			
Bilingual	Hisp	19	2			
Safford	AfAm	0	0			
	Hisp	5	4			
Sewell	AfAm	2	1			
	Hisp	3	4			
SolengTom AfAm Hisp		1	1			
		4	5			
Steele Hi	AfAm	4	2			
	Hisp	3	6			
Tolson	AfAm	1	0			
	Hisp	16	6			
Tully AfAm	AfAm	0	1			
Tully	Hisp	6	3			
Van Buskirk AfAm Hisp	AfAm	0	0			
	Hisp	12	11			
Vesey AfAm Hisp	AfAm	2	2			
	Hisp	28	13			
Warren	AfAm	1	0			
	Hisp	17	2			
Wheeler	AfAm	0	3			
	Hisp	2	3			
White	AfAm	0	0			
	Hisp	10	15			
Whitmore	AfAm	2	0			
	Hisp	3	4			
Wright A	AfAm	5	6			
	Hisp	11	5			