

Exhibit B

Tucson Unified School District
Attrition Study:
Review and Analysis of Attrition Data,
Reasons for Separation
and
Conclusions

A. Attrition Data

Analysis of attrition at the District must begin with an understanding of attrition data at the District, and comparison of that data with other districts, state, and national data.

2015-16	White	AA	Hispanic	NA	API	Total
Separations	234	13	63	3	11	324
Total Site Teachers	1529	71	639	30	52	2321
Attrition Rate	15.3%	18.3%	9.9%	10.0%	21.2%	14.0%

2016-17	White	AA	Hispanic	NA	API	Total
Separations	241	15	61	7	7	331
Total Site Teachers	1632	79	698	40	56	2505
Attrition Rate	14.8%	19.0%	8.7%	17.5%	12.5%	13.2%

2017-18	White	AA	Hispanic	NA	API	Total
Separations	241	11	61	4	10	327
Total Site Teachers	1652	80	742	45	62	2581
Attrition Rate	14.6%	13.8%	8.2%	8.9%	16.1%	12.7%

The overall attrition rate at the district has been trending consistently down over the last three years. More importantly, the attrition rate at TUSD is substantially below state and national average attrition rates, a signal achievement given the low salaries and more difficult working conditions in Arizona as a result of the overall low rank in public school funding in Arizona. The statewide attrition rate in Arizona is 24%;¹ the national attrition rate is 16-17%.²

The Hispanic teacher attrition rate is consistently lower than the overall average and lower than the attrition rate for white teachers. It is substantially lower than the national average for minority teachers.³ Although the African American attrition rate is higher than the overall average, both the rate and the gap to other rates are trending down. Again, most importantly, the African American attrition rate is substantially below the national average, and the gap between African American and white attrition rates is also less than the national average.⁴

In short, there is nothing about attrition at TUSD that appears to be uniquely problematic when compared to state and national data. TUSD is doing better than most districts across the

¹ A Coming Crisis in Teaching? Teacher Supply, Demand, and Shortages in the U.S. , Learning Policy Institute, Leib Sutchter, Linda Darling-Hammond, and Desiree Carver-Thomas (2016).

²Table, Number and percentage distribution of public school teachers, U.S. Department of Education, National Center for Education Statistics, School and Staffing Survey (SASS), available at https://nces.ed.gov/surveys/sass/tables/TFS1213__2016001_cf1n.asp.

³ Id.; see also, Ingersoll, Richard, "What Do the National Data Tell Us About Minority Teacher Shortages?," in "The State of Teacher Diversity in American Education," Albert Shanker Institute, at p. 19.

⁴ Carver-Thomas, D. & Darling-Hammond, L., "Teacher turnover: Why it matters and what we can do about it." Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute (2017), at page 22 (nationally, African American teacher turnover is 22%).

country in wrestling with issues that are national and regional in nature. Nonetheless, TUSD views attrition, and its inverse, retention, as a significant issue for equity, quality and cost of education. TUSD thus continues to focus and devote substantial efforts to reducing attrition, and increasing retention.

B. Reasons for Separation

In addition to the normal anecdotal stories which reach the central HR department in various ways, the District has a regular exit survey which attempts to assess reasons for separation from the District. The District regularly analyzes the results of the survey, though the response rate has been low, because the survey has not been administered at the time of separation, but some time later.

In addition, this past summer, in response to a recommendation from the Special Master, the District's A&E undertook a special study of reasons for departure, designed in collaboration with the Special Master and using two of the members of the Special Master's Implementation Committee as interviewers. The study report is attached hereto as Exhibit 1.

C. Recommendations

Based on the data and study information, District HR staff has the following recommendations.

1. Revamped Separation Process. Participation in the exit survey has been low, and the strength of the specific conclusions to be drawn from the results is less than it could be. The District has decided to incorporate the exit survey as a required element of the separation process when a teacher leaves the District. In addition, as noted in the report from the Assessment and Evaluation Department, the exit survey will be redesigned to improve the precision of the responses in connection with reasons for leaving the District.

Additionally, the District's HR staff will co-ordinate with the A&E Department to analyze exit survey results on an annual basis, and to convene a meeting in the early fall each year to assess the results of the surveys and plan retention activities for the year.

2. "Stay" Interviews. In an effort to increase retention of the District's African American teachers, the district is implementing short "Stay" Interviews for current African American teachers to assess job satisfaction and foster inclusiveness. In the 2018-19 school year, Direct supervisors/administrative staff will be piloting the stay interviews. The Recruitment and Retention committee has recommended starting the pilot with AA teachers in 2018-19 beginning in January of 2019 and then to expand to both AA and Hispanic teachers in 2019-20. Once results are obtained, the district will recommend additional strategies.

Current questions are open ended, designed to prompt unstructured narrative responses, which will be captured by the interviewer with notes. The questions include the following:

- a. "What do you like about your job?" This question sets a positive tone to assess their work satisfaction and helps clue in to what parts of the job employees like and want to experience more of.
- b. "Describe a good day of work you had recently?" This question is designed to tap into their memory to develop specific examples of positive experiences that may be scalable across the school or district.
- c. "Do you feel your skills are being utilized to the fullest?" Best-case scenario here is discovering that the employee has skills the company or leader never knew about, which is a win-win: The employee wins by using personal strengths that raises personal motivation and engagement; the leader wins by offering new opportunities to tap into those strengths, which releases discretionary effort.
- d. "Do you feel you get properly recognized for doing good work?" An opportunity to gauge frustration levels by courageously asking this question and openly accepting the response to brainstorm solutions together.
- e. "Do you feel like you are treated with respect?" This question is to determine the health of the team. Is there blame traveling in different directions, and are people pointing fingers at each other? Are there silos, heavy politics, stonewalling, or people being thrown under the bus?
- f. "What can the District do for you to increase your satisfaction and impact as a teacher here at TUSD?" This final, open-ended question is designed to elicit substantive suggestions for change, which the District can evaluate for practicality and feasibility.

3. Continued Retention Activities

The District will continue to (a) survey teachers on job satisfaction, as it has in prior years, assess the results and evaluate any disparities, and (b) conduct focus groups, as set forth in the USP.

EXHIBIT 1

TUSD Teacher Attrition Study

Purpose of Study

The purpose of this study is twofold: to understand the reasons why teachers leave Tucson Unified School District (TUSD) for another district or leave the profession altogether and to explore if the Teacher Exit Survey accurately represents the reasons why teachers leave.

Introduction – the Profile of Teaching in Arizona

Attracting teachers to work in Arizona currently is a tough sell. Teachers are saddled with significant responsibilities, expected to work long hours while barely being paid a living wage. In December 2017, The Arizona Republic reported that 8,600 teacher vacancies across Arizona could not be filled. It went to state that Arizona is one of the worst-funded public education systems in the country, ranked at 49th. (<https://thinkprogress.org>)

According to Arizona's Department of Education Educator Recruitment and Retention Task Force results, (Educator Recruitment and Retention Task Force, ADE <https://www.azed.gov>, 2015, p. 8)

Nationally, 46% of new teachers are leaving the profession within the first five years of teaching (Hill, 2011). This is especially high in specialized areas such as kindergarten, special education, math, and science (Hill, 2011) (Chan & Richardson, ND). In addition, there are also teachers exiting as a result of retirement (Keating, 2006). With teachers exiting the profession for one reason or another, it is critical that we address this shortage as there will continue to be an increasing number of classrooms lacking fully certified educators year after year. There are various reasons contributing to the exiting of educators in the profession. Some of those reasons include: low pay, lack of community support and respect, paperwork demands, number of required meetings, issues with colleagues, and inadequate teaching materials (Hill, 2011).

As a result of these poor working conditions, teachers in Arizona are leaving the profession at a high rate. In the 2013-14 school year in Arizona, 29% of teachers had three or less years of experience. During that same time, 24% of first year teachers and 20% of second year teachers left their positions and were not reported as teaching in Arizona (Educator Recruitment and Retention Task Force, ADE <https://www.azed.gov>, 2015)

What is it about Arizona that makes the teaching profession unappealing? In 2015, an organization called, *Tucson Values Teachers* conducted a survey among Arizona teachers. Of the 6,163 teachers who responded, the following public/political perception issues were cited as the greatest barriers in remaining a teacher in Arizona:

- **Low value:** Teachers in Arizona feel the public doesn't value them.
- **Low respect:** Teachers in Arizona feel the public doesn't respect them.

TUSD Teacher Attrition Study

- **Low trust:** Teachers in Arizona feel they're not trusted to get on with the job as responsible professionals.
- **Long working hours:** Teachers in Arizona don't have a whole lot of free time at their disposal to compensate for the sacrifices they have to make to do the job.
- **Un-reimbursed costs for resources:** Teachers' pay and the costs they incur just don't square.

The report stated that,

In Arizona, by national standards, teachers are poorly paid. The national median annual wage for secondary school teachers in 2014, according to MAP AZ Dashboard, was \$56,310. In Phoenix it was \$9,000 a year less (\$47,230), and in Tucson it was \$18,000 a year less (\$38,240). In other words, secondary school teachers in Phoenix were getting paid 16 percent below the national median, and those in Tucson were getting paid 32 percent less. It's not just teacher earnings. School budgets in Arizona have been squeezed. Between 2008 and 2015, inflation-adjusted state spending per student was Median Annual Wage for Secondary School Teachers Source: MAP AZ Dashboard 9 cut by 47 percent in Arizona. That made it the most-cut state in the union, rivaled mainly by Louisiana (down 42 percent) and South Carolina (down 37.9 percent). Partly thanks to those hefty cuts in the public education budget, Arizona now has the lowest per-student spending of any state in the union. (<https://www.tucsonvaluesteachers.org>, 2015)

In summary, becoming or remaining a teacher in Arizona poses institutional challenges that extend well beyond the classroom. Arizona districts strive to provide a rigorous education to all children even in the face of high teacher vacancies, low wages, and lack of public/political support. Moreover, these vacancies place added stress onto the schools. Resident teachers, who already have a full working load, must overly compensate their time and resources to support those students without a permanent teacher.

Methodology

Each year, TUSD offers teachers the opportunity to complete the Teacher Exit Survey when they file their paperwork on their intent to leave the district. Typically, less than 15% of teachers complete the Teacher Exit Survey when they separate from the district. Please see Appendix 1 for a complete list of questions on the survey. The results of the Teacher Exit Survey results will serve as the foundation of this study.

In addition to the results from the Teacher Exit Survey, telephone interviews were conducted by two external consultants, one of whom was African American and the other was Hispanic. They conducted informal, confidential interviews with a small cohort of African American teachers (N=6) and Hispanic teachers (N= 6) who had left the district within a year's time. Contacting teachers after they separated from the district proved to be difficult. The consultants were given a list of 30 Hispanic teachers and 19

TUSD Teacher Attrition Study

African American teachers. About a quarter of the phone numbers were wrong, disconnected, out of service, etc. Of the remaining teachers, the majority were not interested in speaking to the consultants or they never responded back to the invitation. Those teachers that the consultants were able to contact were neither hostile nor angry with the district; rather they had simply moved on with their lives and chose not to be interviewed.

For the 12 teachers who did consent to be interviewed by phone, they told the consultants that they were happy to have been contacted and to have someone hear their story. Although the research design initially called for a structured set of questions to ask the teachers, the consultants quickly realized that a formalized approach by telephone would not be successful because of the time commitment. They changed tactics and focused purely on the teacher's reason for leaving and encouraged them to tell their story in an unstructured, open format. Each phone interview lasted between 5 and 15 minutes. Notes were taken during the interview to help contextualize teacher's reasons for leaving from the Teacher Exit Survey. However, the sample size was so small that the responses from these interviews can serve as antedoctal evidence only.

Results

About 393 staff leave TUSD each year out of a teaching core of about 2,743 or 14%. No clear pattern exists for teacher attrition from year to year in terms of specific schools (schools serving low income, schools that are low performing, etc.), school types (Elementary, K-8, Middle or High), job description (classroom teacher, ExEd teacher, specialist, etc.) or geographic regions. Moreover, our teaching core is gradually aging out and about 22% of separations over the last three years were due to reaching retirement qualifications rather than dissatisfaction with their job. Of those staff who leave, typically less than 15% fill out a TUSD Exit Survey.

Across the state of Arizona, hiring teachers with diverse backgrounds and ethnicities has not been particularly successful. Statewide about 80% teachers are White, 13% Hispanic, 3% African American and 4% other ethnicities. TUSD does a better job than the state in hiring diverse staff. TUSD's teacher ethnic breakdown is: 64% White, 29% Hispanic, 3% African, and 4% other ethnicities.

A three-year comparison of the results from the TUSD Exit Survey shows that over time, just less than two-thirds of the respondents are White, followed by Hispanics and African American. Even though the sample size that completed the Exit Survey is small, the distribution is nonetheless fairly representative of the larger staff ethnicities.

TUSD Teacher Attrition Study

Table 1. A 3 Year Comparison of the Teacher Exit Response Rate by Race/Ethnicity							
<i>*2017-18 Data is only to Jan. 2018 and represents only half a year of data</i>							
	2015-2016	2016-2017	2017-2018*	2015-2016	2016-2017	2017-2018 *	TUSD Staff Ethnicity Rates
Asian/Pacific Is	1	2	0	2%	4%	0%	2%
African American	6	2	0	13%	4%	0%	3%
White	29	33	15	62%	61%	94%	64%
Hispanic/Latino	4	7	1	8%	13%	6%	29%
Native American	1	0	0	2%	0%	0%	2%
Not Specified/UK	6	10	4	13%	18%	0%	0%
Total	47	54	21	100%	100%	100%	100%

Across the state, 74% of teachers are female. In TUSD, this trend is not different; women make up 74% of the teaching core. Table 2 shows that three quarters of the staff who completed the Exit survey are also female. Tables 2 and 3 suggest that over time, no single ethnicity or gender is leaving at a greater rate than the overall distribution of the population of teachers in TUSD.

Table 2. A 3 Year Comparison of the Teacher Exit Response Rate by Gender							
<i>*2017-18 Data is only to Jan. 2018 and represents only half a year of data</i>							
	2015-2016	2016-2017	2017-2018*	2015-2016	2016-2017	2017-2018 *	TUSD Staff Gender Rates
Male	7	15	2	15%	28%	9.5%	26%
Female	37	39	19	79%	72%	90.5%	74%
Transgender	0	0	0	0%	0%	0.0%	0%
UK	3	0	0	6%			0%
Total	47	54	21	100%	100%	100%	100%

Table 3 shows the breakdown of age of teachers who completed the Exit Survey. It appears that a little more than a quarter of our teachers leave TUSD in their mid-twenties to their mid-thirties and a little more than a quarter leave TUSD in their mid-fifties and older. The remaining teachers (about 45%) leave the district during their prime professional year between the ages of 36 to 54.

TUSD Teacher Attrition Study

Table 3. A 3 Year Comparison of the Teacher Exit Response Rate by Age

<i>*2017-18 Data is only to Jan. 2018 and represents only half a year of data</i>						
	2015-2016	2016-2017	2017-2018*	2015-2016	2016-2017	2017-2018 *
16-20	0	0	0	0%	0%	0%
21-25	0	3	2	0%	6%	10%
26-35	8	13	6	17%	24%	29%
36-45	12	17	1	26%	31%	5%
46-55	10	7	3	21%	13%	14%
56-65	15	13	8	32%	24%	38%
66-75	2	1	1	4%	2%	5%
76-85	0	0	0	0%	0%	0%
85 or over	0	0	0	0%	0%	0%
Total	47	54	21	100%	100%	100%

The results of the *Tucson Values Teachers* study appears to conform to what teachers report on the Teacher Exit Survey when they leave TUSD. On the TUSD Exit Survey when teachers were asked, ‘which of the following factors is the most important factor in your decision to leave’, about a quarter of respondents chose working conditions as the most frequent response, followed by family circumstances and wages. Please see Table 4 for a list of primary reasons over three years.

Table 4. A 3 Year Comparison of the Teacher Exit Response Rate to the question, ‘Which of the following factors is the most important factor in your decision to leave?’

<i>*2017-18 Data is only to Jan. 2018 and represents only half a year of data</i>						
	2015-2016	2016-2017	2017-2018*	2015-2016	2016-2017	2017-2018 *
Career Change	2	1	1	5%	2%	5%
Opportunity to Advance	4	5	1	10%	8%	5%
Return to School or Training	1	0	0	3%	0%	0%
Wages	6	7	2	15%	11%	9%
Working Conditions	12	15	5	31%	24%	23%
Workload too high	3	1	2	8%	2%	9%
Workload too low	0	0	0	0%	0%	0%
Legal or other conflict	1	1	0	3%	2%	0%
Lack of recognition	0	1	0	0%	2%	0%
Family Circumstances	5	11	4	13%	18%	18%

TUSD Teacher Attrition Study

Health Reasons (my own, or someone else's)	4	2	3	10%	3%	14%
Sexual or other harassment	0	0	0	0%	0%	0%
Other (please specify)	1	18	4	3%	29%	18%
Total	39	62	22	100%	100%	100%

On the TUSD Exit Survey when teachers were asked, 'which of the following factors is the second most important factor in your decision to leave', working conditions and wages were cited most consistently over time. Other issues that took precedence in a single year included not having an opportunity to advance, workload too high, lack of recognition, and family circumstances. These secondary issues suggested more interpersonal issues that are related to professional support. Please see Table 5 for a list of secondary reasons why teacher left the district.

Table 5. A 3 Year Comparison of the Teacher Exit Response Rate to the question, 'Which of the following factors is the second most important factor in your decision to leave?'

2017-18 Data is only to Jan. 2018 and represents only half a year of data

	2015-2016	2016-2017	2017-2018*	2015-2016	2016-2017	2017-2018 *
Career Change	3	0	0	8%	0%	0%
Opportunity to Advance	2	7	0	5%	11%	0%
Return to School or Training	1	0	0	3%	0%	0%
Wages	8	11	2	21%	18%	9%
Working Conditions	9	10	3	24%	16%	14%
Workload too high	2	7	3	5%	11%	14%
Workload too low	0	0	0	0%	0%	0%
Legal or other conflict	0	1	0	0%	2%	0%
Lack of recognition	4	1	1	11%	2%	5%
Family Circumstances	4	3	5	11%	5%	23%
Health Reasons (my own, or someone else's)	3	2	1	8%	3%	5%
Sexual or other harassment	1	0	1	3%	0%	5%
Other (please specify)	1	20	6	3%	32%	27%
Total	38	62	22	100%	100%	100%

One limitation of the TUSD Exit Survey is the ambiguity about what 'working conditions' means and if teachers share a common understanding of the term: 'working conditions'. According to the National Center for Education Statistics, teacher working conditions can be defined as workload, compensation, school and district support for teachers' professional development, school decision making, school safety, student readiness to learn, and public respect for teachers. (<https://nces.ed.gov>, 1996). Working

TUSD Teacher Attrition Study

conditions therefore encompasses multiple aspects not only of the overall school environment, but also includes district support, and public perception. It is unclear when teachers chose 'working conditions' on the TUSD Exit Survey what specific issues they were referring to.

One method to understand more clearly what 'working conditions' meant was to review the responses from the informal interviews. During the interview, teachers were asked why they left the district. Of the 12 teachers who were responded, about a third were exceptional education teachers. The reasons that they left were qualitatively different from the other two-thirds of the teachers. The ExEd teachers left largely because they felt unsupported by administration in how behavior management was handled and they felt that more accountability was needed for compliance issues including class size and safety. The rest of the teachers left because of job advancement elsewhere, relocated elsewhere, were frustrated with the low wages, or left education altogether.

When informants were asked if they would return to TUSD, 17% indicated that they would like to return, 8% indicated that it was a possibility, 25% are currently working in other districts and are happy where they were, and 42% would not return because they either moved away, left the profession, and/or felt devalued with low wages or opportunities for advancement. The remaining 8% was unknown.

Teachers were also asked on the Exit Survey, 'would you recommend the TUSD as an employer?'. The trend over three years is mixed. In 2015-16, most teachers (61%) concurred, in 2016-17, only about half of teachers (47%) concurred, and for the first half of 2017-18, only a third (32%) concurred. This data shows that teachers are mixed in their feelings about recommending others to work in TUSD. However, it is unclear from this data if teachers are wary of the teaching profession in general because of the low value from public/political entities or if it is specifically TUSD that they are wary of. Please see Table 6 for a summary of teacher's perceptions of TUSD as an employer.

Table 6. A 3 Year Comparison of the Teacher Exit Responses to the Question, 'Would you recommend the Tucson Unified School District as an employer?'						
<i>*2017-18 Data is only to Jan. 2018 and represents only half a year of data</i>						
	2015- 2016	2016- 2017	2017- 2018*	2015- 2016	2016- 2017	2017- 2018 *
Yes	28	27	7	61%	47%	32%
No	18	31	15	39%	53%	68%
Total	46	58	22	100%	100%	100%

TUSD Teacher Attrition Study

Summary

Despite the public and political lack of support for public education in Arizona, Tucson Unified School District has done an admirable job of retaining teachers. In 2016-17, TUSD had about 15% teacher attrition, compared to state average of 17%, and national average of 17%. Additionally, for the teachers who remain with TUSD, their overall job satisfaction is high. According to the 2017-18 Staff School Quality Survey, 89% of teachers responded that they agreed/strongly agreed to the statement, 'Overall, I am very satisfied with my school'. The majority of teachers who completed this survey also wanted to remain in education. Ninety-four percent of teachers agreed/strongly agreed to the statement, 'I want to continue employment with the District'.

Students in TUSD are generally satisfied with their teachers as well. Each year, TUSD administers a Student Survey of Teachers (SST) to students, grades K-12. This survey is part of the Teacher Evaluation and is intended to measure classroom culture and climate from a student's perspective. On a Likert scale from 1 (strongly disagree) to 4 (strongly agree), students scored their teachers, on average, about a 3.4. In other words, students were in agreement overall that their teachers were supportive, respectful, responsible, and provided challenging materials.

For the teachers who choose to leave, according to the Teacher Exit Survey, about a quarter chose working conditions as the most frequent response, followed by family circumstances and wages. The results from the interviews provided additional information. Results from the interviews indicated that multiple reasons for leaving were frequently listed which culminated into the decision to separate from the district. Reasons included: low wages, moving to a new location, exceptional educational concerns, moving to other districts or charter, or leaving the profession altogether.

Salient issues that emerged from the interviews among African American and Hispanic teachers (N=12) were both professional and personal. Professionally, teachers wanted the opportunity to advance and they wanted higher wages. Personally, they wanted more support and recognition for their dedication and expertise.

For those teachers who worked in exceptional education, they voiced concern for the safety in the classroom, feelings of a lack of administrative support, and a perceived lack of a sense of urgency. These issues were reported as systemic by one or more of the exceptional educational teachers interviewed.

Recommendations:

1. Include the Teacher Exit Survey as a required part of the separation process to increase response rates.
2. A more specific definition is needed for the term, 'working conditions' on the Teacher Exit Survey. One approach might be to list a number of working conditions (with additional space for the teacher to add ones not included) and ask teachers to rate them in terms of reasons for

TUSD Teacher Attrition Study

leaving. With greater definition, TUSD will understand more clearly which working conditions to focus on.

3. Add a question on the Teacher Exit Survey that would clearly separate questions about recommending TUSD as an employer from the inference of advocating education as a profession by recommending TUSD as an employer.
4. Add a question to the survey about the teacher's most recent job title.
5. A feedback or coaching loop is needed for teachers who want to advance within TUSD but were not able to get hired for their desired position. Teachers may not understand why they were not chosen and as a result could develop feelings of resentment or the perception that they were passed over because of something beyond their professional expertise. Teachers who do not become promoted need additional support and guidance to understand how specifically they need to improve their skill set to be able to advance professionally.
6. Administrators need to reassure teachers that any out-of-compliance incidents by Exceptional Education teachers need immediate follow-up and resolution. The Exceptional Education department provides critical services and any perceptions of non-compliance must be dealt with in a case-by-case situation.