

1 **RUSING LOPEZ & LIZARDI, P.L.L.C.**

6363 North Swan Road, Suite 151
2 Tucson, Arizona 85718
Telephone: (520) 792-4800
3 Facsimile: (520)529-4262

4 J. William Brammer, Jr. (State Bar No. 002079)
wbrammer@rllaz.com
5 Oscar S. Lizardi (State Bar No. 016626)
olizardi@rllaz.com
6 Michael J. Rusing (State Bar No. 006617)
mrusing@rllaz.com
7 Patricia V. Waterkotte (State Bar No. 029231)
pvictory@rllaz.com

8 **TUCSON UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT**

9 LEGAL DEPARTMENT
10 1010 E. TENTH STREET
TUCSON, AZ 85719
(520) 225-6040

11 Julie Tolleson (State Bar No. 012913)
12 Julie.Tolleson@tusd1.org
Samuel E. Brown (State Bar No. 027474)
13 Samuel.Brown@tusd1.org

14 *Attorneys for Tucson Unified School District No. One, et al.*

15 **IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
16 **FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA**

17 Roy and Josie Fisher, et al.,
18 Plaintiffs

19 v.
20 United States of America,
21 Plaintiff-Intervenor,

22 v.
23 Anita Lohr, et al.,
24 Defendants,

25 and
26 Sidney L. Sutton, et al.,
27 Defendants-Intervenors,

CV 74-90 TUC DCB
(Lead Case)

**RESPONSE TO FISHER
PLAINTIFFS' OBJECTIONS TO
TUSD'S FINAL REVISED
COMPREHENSIVE MAGNET
PLAN**

CV 74-204 TUC DCB
(Consolidated Case)

1	Maria Mendoza, et al.
2	Plaintiffs,
3	United States of America,
4	Plaintiff-Intervenor,
5	v.
6	Tucson Unified School District No. One, et al.
7	Defendants.

8 Tucson Unified School District #1 (“TUSD”), by and through undersigned counsel,
9 responds to the Fisher Plaintiffs’ Objection to TUSD’s Revised Comprehensive Magnet
10 Plan (ECF 1815) as follows.

11 **I. Introduction**

12 On January 16, 2015, the Court entered an order requiring TUSD to file a Revised
13 CMP in four months (“Comprehensive Magnet Plan Order”). *See* ECF 1753. The
14 Comprehensive Magnet Plan Order also required that TUSD, in consultation with the
15 Special Master, work with its schools to prepare individual school improvement plans
16 during the three months following the order. Between February and May 2015, the District
17 worked closely with the Special Master and his Implementation Committee member, Dr.
18 Rebecca Montañó, to finalize the Revised Comprehensive Magnet Plan and its individual
19 plans. *See* Declaration of M. Taylor (“Taylor Decl.”) ¶ 2. To permit a lengthy period of
20 time for feedback and comment, TUSD provided revised individual magnet school plans to
21 the Special Master on March 13, 2015. Taylor Decl. ¶ 3. The time spent reviewing magnet
22 plan issues and conferring with the superintendent, assistant superintendent, district
23 administrators and principals is reflected in both the invoices of the Special Master (7.9
24 hours in February, 10.9 hours in March, 2.5 hours in April and 20 hours in May on the
25 Revised CMP) and of Dr. Montañó (15 hours in February, 13.5 hours in March, 2.5 hours in
26 April and 3.2 hours in May on the Revised CMP). *See* Taylor Decl. ¶¶ 4-5, Ex. A, Special
27 Master Invoices, Ex. B, Dr. Montañó Invoices.

Rusing Lopez & Lizardi, P.L.L.C.
6363 North Swan Road, Suite 151
Tucson, Arizona 85718
Telephone: (520) 792-4800

1 On May 15, 2015, TUSD filed the Revised Comprehensive Magnet Plan and the
2 individual magnet school plans. *See* ECF 1803. Following further collaboration, on June
3 11, 2015, TUSD filed the board-approved Revised Comprehensive Magnet Plan. On June
4 18, 2015, the Mendoza and Fisher Plaintiffs filed objections to the plan. *See* ECF 1808. In
5 an effort to address the objections raised by the Plaintiffs, and in consultation with the
6 Special Master, TUSD has made further revisions to the Comprehensive Magnet Plan. The
7 nature of these revisions will require board approval. A redlined version of the revised Plan
8 with the further revisions is attached to Martha Taylor’s declaration as Exhibit C. As
9 discussed below, the Fisher Plaintiffs’ objections have been addressed either by: (1) the
10 January Comprehensive Magnet Plan Order, or (2) modifications to the Comprehensive
11 Magnet Plan which address the Fisher objections and the Special Master now considers
12 those issues resolved. Accordingly, TUSD requests the Court to enter an order approving
13 the Comprehensive Magnet Plan so that TUSD may move forward with implementation.

14 **II. The Fisher Plaintiffs Are Re-Raising Previously Addressed Objections.**

15 The first three objections raised by the Fisher Plaintiffs relate to: (1) the timing of
16 withdrawal of magnet status; (2) the criteria for evaluation of magnet status (they are
17 arguing socioeconomic measures should be included); and (3) the allegation that there are
18 an excessive number of magnet schools in TUSD. Each of these objections was fully
19 litigated before the court-ordered revision of the Comprehensive Magnet Plan and the
20 objection provides no basis for revisiting the Court’s prior decision. On December 9, 2014,
21 the Special Master made a report and recommendation on several issues including: (1)
22 whether the process for withdrawal of magnet status is “too slow; (2) whether the criteria
23 for withdrawing magnet status should be modified; and (3) whether the Court should find
24 that there are “too many” magnet schools in TUSD. *See* ECF 1730. TUSD briefed the
25 issues. *See* ECF 1735. The Court’s disposition of those arguments is reflected in the
26 Comprehensive Magnet Plan Order. The Court should disregard these re-urged and
27 previously-resolved objections in their entirety.
28

1 Moreover, any remaining issues regarding continuing magnet funding after
 2 withdrawal of magnet status and the timing of Special Master recommendations on
 3 integration likewise have been resolved. *See* Taylor Decl. ¶ 8, Ex. E, Special Master
 4 6/23/15 Email “Changes in the CMP” (“Magnet funding will not be continued beyond the
 5 year in which funding is withdrawn but schools that had been magnet schools will be
 6 funded as needed to meet student needs. This can exceed formula funding. [. . .] My
 7 recommendations with respect to integration will take place no later than October of the two
 8 school years remaining and recommendations relating to academic performance will be
 9 made as soon as the data from the previous year becomes available.”) *See also* Exhibit C,
 10 Redlined Revised Comprehensive Magnet Plan.

11 **III. The Board Meeting Transcript Reflects Accurate Communications on the** 12 **Magnet Process**

13 The Fisher Plaintiffs launch into a two-page, unjustified and unsupported, complaint
 14 that there is a problem in the Governing Board review process because TUSD
 15 administration purportedly failed to inform the governing board of the Fisher Plaintiffs’
 16 objections. The Fisher Plaintiffs do not identify one issue or objection they believe should
 17 have been raised to the Governing Board but was not. Indeed, the majority of the Fisher’s
 18 objections are not issues the Governing Board should be reconsidering given that the Court
 19 already has put the issues of the pillars, timing, and number of magnets to rest in its January
 20 Comprehensive Magnet Plan Order.

21 The Fisher Plaintiffs argue specifically that TUSD leadership inaccurately
 22 represented to the Governing Board that the Special Master had expressed “conditional
 23 approval.” The Fisher Plaintiffs do not explain what they meant by “conditional approval”
 24 or why that would be inaccurate. The following is the statement made at 3:36:12 in the
 25 meeting video:

26
 27 Yes ma’am. So Richard will come back up and walk us through the Magnet
 28 Plan and I believe we didn’t get an email on the magnet plan. It is a
 study/action item and if the board feels that they have enough information I
 would recommend that the board consider approving the comprehensive

magnet plan. We've been firing different renditions back and forth, the courts been looking at them back and forth. At this point, we've had a member of the special master's implementation team work side by side with former Asst. supt. Steve Holmes on this project so there's a lot of synchronicity between the special master's implementation team and the district on this and there were quite a few conversations with principals on sites with this so there's a lot of work that's gone into it. So the quicker the principals get the Board's green light to begin advertising and knowing what they're going to be held accountable for, the better they can prepare their campus plans. I just wanted to put that bug in the Board's ear. Mr. Foster please.

The phrase "conditional approval" is not used. Instead, Dr. Sanchez explains that the Comprehensive Magnet Plan was developed in collaboration with the Special Master's implementation team. This statement is accurate and is supported by the declaration of Martha Taylor and the invoices of the Special Master and his implementation committee member who each devoted many hours to working with the District on the Comprehensive Magnet Plan.

IV. TUSD Has Responded to the RFIs and There is No Exclusionary Option

TUSD responded to the Fisher Plaintiffs' request for information. *See* Taylor Decl. ¶ 8, Ex. F, TUSD Response to Fisher Plaintiffs' RFI.

The Fisher Plaintiffs object that although the District stated it would not proceed with the exclusionary option for Ochoa Elementary, that decision was not evident in the Revised Comprehensive Magnet Plan filed with the Court last month. That revision now has been made. *See* Exhibit C, Redlined Revised Comprehensive Magnet Plan. The Special Master confirmed the resolution of this exclusionary issue with all parties. *See* Taylor Decl. ¶ 8, Ex. E, Special Master 6/23/15 Email "Changes in the CMP" ("There is no exclusionary option either now or in the future.")

V. Conclusion

Based on the foregoing, TUSD respectfully requests that the Fisher Plaintiffs' objections be overruled and that the Court enter an order permitting TUSD to proceed with implementation of the Revised Comprehensive Magnet Plan filed herewith.

Rusing Lopez & Lizardi, P.L.L.C.
6363 North Swan Road, Suite 151
Tucson, Arizona 85718
Telephone: (520) 792-4800

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1 DATED this 26th day of June, 2015.

2 **RUSING LOPEZ & LIZARDI, P.L.L.C.**

3
4 s/ J. William Brammer, Jr.
5 J. William Brammer, Jr.
6 Oscar S. Lizardi
7 Michael J. Rusing
8 Patricia V. Waterkotte
9 Attorneys for Tucson Unified School District No.
10 One, et al.

11 **TUCSON UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT**
12 **LEGAL DEPARTMENT**
13 Julie C. Tolleson
14 Samuel E. Brown
15 Attorneys for Tucson Unified School District No.
16 One, et al.

17 **ORIGINAL** of the foregoing filed via the CM/ECF
18 Electronic Notification System and transmittal of a
19 Notice of Electronic Filing provided to all parties
20 that have filed a notice of appearance in the District
21 Court Case, as listed below.

22 **ANDREW H. MARKS**
23 Attorney for Special Master
24 Law Office of Andrew Marks PLLC
25 1001 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
26 Suite 1100
27 Washington, DC 20004
28 amarks@markslawoffices.com

LOIS D. THOMPSON CSBN 093245
JENNIFER L. ROCHE CSBN 254538
Attorneys for Mendoza Plaintiffs
Proskauer Rose LLP
2049 Century Park East, Suite 3200
Los Angeles, California 90067
(310) 557-2900
lthompson@proskauer.com
jroche@proskauer.com

JUAN RODRIGUEZ, CSBN 282081
THOMAS A. SAENZ, CSBN 159430
Attorney for Mendoza Plaintiffs
Mexican American LDEF
634 S. Spring St. 11th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90014
(213) 629-2512
jrodriguez@maldef.org
tsaebz@maldef.org

Rusing Lopez & Lizardi, P.L.L.C.
6363 North Swan Road, Suite 151
Tucson, Arizona 85718
Telephone: (520) 792-4800

1 RUBIN SALTER, JR. ASBN 001710
2 KRISTIAN H. SALTER ASBN 026810
3 Attorney for Fisher, et al., Plaintiffs
4 177 North Church Avenue, Suite 903
5 Tucson, Arizona 85701-1119
6 rsjr2@aol.com

7 ANURIMA BHARGAVA
8 ZOE M. SAVITSKY CAN 281616
9 JAMES EICHNER
10 Attorneys for Plaintiff-Intervenor
11 Educational Opportunities Section
12 Civil Rights Division
13 U.S. Department of Justice
14 950 Pennsylvania Avenue, SW
15 Patrick Henry Building, Suite 4300
16 Washington, DC 20530
17 (202) 305-3223
18 anurima.bhargava@usdoj.gov
19 zoe.savitsky@usdoj.gov
20 james.eichner@usdoj.gov

21 JULIE TOLLESON ASBN 012913
22 Tucson Unified School District
23 Legal Department
24 1010 E 10th St
25 Tucson, AZ 85719
26 520-225-6040
27 Julie.Tolleson@tusd1.org

28 s/ Jason Linaman

Rusing Lopez & Lizardi, P.L.L.C.
6363 North Swan Road, Suite 151
Tucson, Arizona 85718
Telephone: (520) 792-4800