

## **Exhibit C-1**

# ***TUSD***

## **Administrator and Certificated Staff Outreach, Recruitment, and Retention Plan**

### **BACKGROUND**

Pursuant to the Unitary Status Plan (USP), Tucson Unified School District (TUSD) shall seek to enhance the racial and ethnic diversity of its administrators and certificated staff through its recruitment, hiring, assignment, promotion, pay, demotion, and dismissal practices and procedures. In this regard, TUSD is focused primarily on the following areas: Outreach and Recruitment, Hiring, Assignment of Administrators and Certificated Staff, Retention, and Reductions in Force.

This Administrator and Certificated Staff Outreach, Recruitment, and Retention Plan (the “Plan”) outlines TUSD’s approach to the first and fourth focus area as one part of TUSD’s comprehensive and coordinated approach to addressing Faculty and Staff Assignment within the context of the USP. The primary goals of TUSD’s outreach, recruitment, and retention efforts are as follows:

1. To develop outreach and recruitment strategies to attract highly-qualified administrators and certificated staff.
2. To develop strategies to retain highly-qualified administrators and certificated staff.
3. To develop specific outreach and recruitment strategies to attract highly-qualified African-American and Latino administrators and certificated staff.
4. To develop specific strategies to retain highly-qualified African-American and Latino administrators and certificated staff.

TUSD has designated an employee to coordinate personnel recruitment efforts. This employee coordinates the development of outreach, recruitment, and retention efforts (as outlined in the plan below) through the recruitment team. This employee will be responsible for organizing and monitoring TUSD outreach, recruitment, and retention efforts pursuant to the USP.

**Comment [01]:** MENDOZA: What is the significance of this capitalized phrase? Is it intended to focus a more limited approach than embracing Administrators and Certificated Staff? Is it seeking to draw a distinction between “certificated” and noncertificated staff and, if so, for what purpose?

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The purpose of the Plan is to recruit and retain highly qualified and appropriately certificated administrators and certificated staff, representative from diverse backgrounds and cultures, who are competent and ready to manage, teach, engage, and challenge our present and future learners.

The Plan focuses on two separate but interrelated objectives, aligned with the goals identified above: (1) fulfilling general human resources needs, and (2) fulfilling specific USP-related human resources needs. The Plan aims to recruit and retain highly qualified 21<sup>st</sup> Century educators who represent broad spectrums of diverse backgrounds and cultures, with the skillsets to implement the latest educator processes to drive superior teaching. Recruitment is principally focused on Math, Science, and Special Education teachers.

TUSD's recruiter is responsible for the development of the Plan, with input from a racially and ethnically diverse advisory recruitment team comprised of school-level and district-level administrators, certificated staff and human resources personnel. While a retention plan is not required by the USP, TUSD's strategy is to combine recruitment and retention efforts to attract and to keep a highly-qualified and diverse workforce. In developing and implementing the Plan TUSD shall, at a minimum,:

1. Include measures to ensure that TUSD conducts recruitment for all employment vacancies on a nondiscriminatory basis;
2. Identify and address any and all disparities identified in the Labor Market Analysis<sup>1</sup>;
3. Develop a process for annual modifications based on reviews of the previous year's recruiting and retention data and the effectiveness of past recruiting and retention practices in attracting, and retaining, qualified African American and Latino candidates and candidates with Spanish language bilingual certifications;
4. Develop a nationwide recruiting strategy based, at minimum, on the outcome of the Labor Market Analysis, which shall include specific techniques to recruit African American and Latino candidates, and candidates with Spanish language bilingual certifications from across the country;
5. Create a process to invite retired African American and Latino administrators and certificated staff to be considered for open positions for which they are qualified;
6. Incorporate strategies for building and utilizing partnerships with local employers that recruit nationally to promote TUSD employment opportunities to their prospective employees and their families;
7. Develop local programs to identify and support local high school, college, and university students to interest them in teaching careers, including, for college and university students, exploring and promoting opportunities for teaching in the District; and
8. Develop strategies to encourage and provide support for African American and Latino non-certificated staff (e.g., paraprofessionals) who are interested in pursuing certification.

**Comment [NR2]:** MENDOZA: The USP requires the District to "develop and implement a plan to recruit qualified African American and Latino candidates for open administrator and certificated staff positions." USP, Section IV, C, 3 at 17. It does not specify that these recruitment efforts are to focus on math, science and special education teachers. Recruitment must focus on all open administrator and certificated staff positions and not solely on math, science and special education teaching positions. Further, in their February 12, 2013 email, the Mendoza Plaintiffs commented on the on-going concern about the District's failure to recruit, promote, and/or retain African American and Latino school principals and referenced the fact that it was for that reason that Appendix D to the USP expressly reported on those numbers. Mendoza Plaintiffs therefore OBJECT to the failure of the recruitment plan to focus on recruitment, promotion, and retention of African American and Latino principals.

**Comment [NR3]:** MENDOZA: Mendoza Plaintiffs concur with the Fisher Plaintiffs' comments that the USP requires the District to "hire or designate an individual in the human resources department who shall coordinate and review the District's outreach, recruitment, hiring, assignment and retention efforts..." USP, IV, B, 1 at 16. The USP also requires the District to hire or designate "a director-level employee to coordinate personnel recruitment efforts." USP, IV, B, 2 at 16. Mendoza Plaintiffs concur with the Fisher Plaintiffs that the USP "contemplates the creation of two distinct positions" in order to adequately fulfill the requirements imposed by the USP. Mendoza Plaintiffs OBJECT to the District collapsing these distinct positions into one position.

**Comment [04]:** MENDOZA: Mendoza Plaintiffs OBJECT to the District's reliance on the referenced Labor Market Analysis given the multiple problems with that analysis and the failure of the District to have addressed the issues identified by the Mendoza Plaintiffs in their February 12, 2013 email. Mendoza Plaintiffs also REQUEST a copy of the "revised" LMA referred to in footnote 1.

<sup>1</sup> This Labor Market Analysis (LMA) began in October of 2012, and was revised in the spring of 2013.

## **Administrator and Certificated Staff Outreach, Recruitment, and Retention Plan**

### **1. Measures to Ensure Nondiscriminatory Recruitment of All Employment Vacancies**

TUSD will follow internal policies and regulations which mandate that TUSD employees shall not discriminate against employees or applicants on the basis of race, color, religion gender, age, national origin, disability, marital status, and sexual orientation in any of its activities or operations. (See Governing Board Policy AC and ACA, and related regulations). These activities include, but are not limited to, hiring and firing of staff, selection of volunteers and vendors, and provision of services. TUSD is committed to providing an inclusive and welcoming environment for all members of our staff.

**Comment [NR5]:** MENDOZA: Mendoza Plaintiffs concur with the Special Master's comment that the District's non-discrimination policies have not been consistently provided on District recruitment and hiring materials and urge the District to consistently provide them.

### **2. Address Disparities Identified in the Labor Market Analysis**

The District hired an outside consultant to undertake a workforce or labor market analysis that compares the actual number of African-American and Latino administrators and certificated staff to the statistical expectation using various demographic group availability rates derived from labor market data. Differences between the actual and expected numbers are considered "statistically significant" when the number of standard deviations of the observed disparity is above approximately 2 or below approximately -2. Positive differences that are less than approximately 2 standard deviations and negative differences that are greater than -2 standard deviations are not statistically significant. (The threshold for statistical significance is +1.96 standard deviation.)

**Comment [NR6]:** MENDOZA: Mendoza Plaintiffs' OBJECTIONS to this section are found in their written comments.

#### *(Greater than 2)*

A statistically significant positive disparity (more than +2) means that TUSD has a higher number of identified employees than is available in the relevant labor market.

#### *(Less than -2)*

A statistically significant negative disparity (less than -2) means that TUSD has a lower number of identified employees than is available in the relevant labor market.

#### *(Between -2 and +2)*

A disparity greater than -2, but less than +2, means that the disparity level is not statistically significant.

Relevant findings are as follows (see **Attachment 1, LMA**):

- Compared to the state of Arizona, TUSD's labor force has higher-than-expected staff levels of African American and Latino administrators and certificated staff. This means that a comparative analysis between the available relevant labor market in Arizona and TUSD reflected a positive disparity in the African American and Latino administrator and certificated staff workforce. This data is statistically significant (+3.14 for African

American Administrators, +6.47 Latino Administrators; +3.04 for African American Certificated Staff; and +22.83 for Latino Certificated Staff).

- Compared to surrounding states, TUSD's labor force has lower-than-expected staff levels of African American administrators (central and site-based combined). However, a comparative analysis between the available relevant labor markets and TUSD reflected that the disparities are not statistically significant. Compared to the United States, TUSD's labor force has statistically significant, lower-than-expected levels of African American administrators (central and site-based combined). (-2.60).
- Compared to surrounding states, TUSD's labor force has statistically significant, higher-than-expected levels of African American central administrators, specifically. (+2.64, +2.57, and +2.88).
- Compared to surrounding states, TUSD's labor force has statistically significant, lower-than-expected levels of African American certificated staff. (-7.29, -7.45, and -6.63). This means that a comparative analysis between the available relevant labor market in surrounding states and TUSD reflected a negative disparity in the African American certificated staff workforce.
- Compared to the United States, TUSD's labor force has statistically significant, lower-than-expected levels of African American certificated staff. (-10.37). This means that a comparative analysis between the available relevant labor market in the U.S. and TUSD reflected a negative disparity in the African American certificated staff workforce.
- Compared to surrounding states and the United States, TUSD's labor force has statistically significant, higher-than-expected levels of Latino administrators (central and site-based combined). (+3.97, +3.23, +4.27, +15.33).
- Compared to surrounding states and the United States, TUSD's labor force has statistically significant, higher-than-expected levels of Latino certificated staff. (+6.57, +5.35, +7.26, +33.12).

Based on the LMA:

1. There are significant disparities when comparing TUSD's African American certificated staff workforce with the relevant labor markets for the U.S. and for surrounding states.
2. There is a slight disparity when comparing TUSD's African American administrator workforce with the U.S. relevant labor market.

Based on this information, TUSD's outreach, recruitment, and retention strategies will primarily target African American certificated staff, in addition to continuing to recruit and retain a diverse

**Comment [NR7]:** MENDOZA: Mendoza Plaintiffs OBJECT to this finding based on their objections to and questions concerning the underlying data.

**Comment [NR8]:** MENDOZA: Mendoza Plaintiffs OBJECT to this finding based on their objections to and questions concerning the underlying data.

**Comment [NR9]:** MENDOZA: Mendoza Plaintiffs OBJECT to this finding based on their objections to and questions concerning the underlying data.

**Comment [NR10]:** MENDOZA: Mendoza Plaintiffs OBJECT to this finding based on their objections to and questions concerning the underlying data.

**Comment [NR11]:** MENDOZA: Mendoza Plaintiffs OBJECT to this finding based on their objections to and questions concerning the underlying data.

**Comment [NR12]:** MENDOZA: Mendoza Plaintiffs OBJECT to this finding based on their objections to and questions concerning the underlying data.

**Comment [NR13]:** MENDOZA: Mendoza Plaintiffs OBJECT to this finding based on their objections to and questions concerning the underlying data.

**Comment [NR14]:** MENDOZA: Mendoza Plaintiffs OBJECT to these findings based on their objections to and questions concerning the underlying data.

workforce, with a focus on Math, Science, Exceptional Education, and Spanish/Bilingual certificated staff.

**Comment [015]:** MENDOZA: While the Mendoza Plaintiffs agree that the District should seek to recruit more African American certified staff, they disagree with the balance of this statement and OBJECT to the expressed primary target and focus.

### C. Recruitment and Retention Advisory Committee

The Recruitment Advisory Committee was created in 2008 to enhance recruitment efforts. The committee consists of a 15 member diverse group of community members, select diverse District leaders, corporations, colleges/universities, teachers, and administrators. The role of the Advisory Committee will expand to enhance the retention of African American and Latino staff. TUSD has capitalized on a synergy of critical thinking in various domains. This diverse group, chaired by the District recruiter, actively engages the community and key constituencies in the District's Recruitment and Retention Plan and works collaboratively to recruit and retain highly qualified teachers who live and work in the District.

**Comment [NR16]:** MENDOZA: The USP requires the District to develop a plan to recruit qualified African American and Latino candidates for open administrator and certificated staff positions with the "input of a racially and ethnically diverse recruitment team comprised of school-level and district-level administrators, certificated staff and human resources personnel." USP, IV, C, 3 at 17. Mendoza Plaintiffs seek clarification of "diverse" to ensure that it includes "racially" and "ethnically" diverse members.

The committee brainstorms and provides suggestions to enhance the roles and responsibilities for recruitment, retention, and outreach with a focus on diversity challenges, information resources, and ethnic-cultural opportunities in the community. The committee analyzes risks and opportunities for the recruitment program to create potential solutions (e.g., priority hiring needs and vacancies, potential incentives, community outreach, the need for adequate marketing). The advisory committee meets quarterly.

### D. Recruitment of African American and Latino Candidates for Open Administrator and Certificated Staff Positions

1. **Make the Move Program:** The program takes existing TUSD General Education teachers and provides incentives to train and become Special Education Teachers. The following are incentives that have been generated to fulfill this effort.
2. **Recruitment Incentives:** TUSD utilizes incentives for critical needs (math, science and special education) and hard to staff sites to include stipends in accordance to federal guidelines. A one-time stipend of \$2,500 and moving expense up to \$2,000 is offered to new incoming teachers.
  - Tuition Reimbursement (Reimbursement not to exceed \$5,000 per individual per lifetime)
  - CCS-AEPA Study Group (Test preparation class)
  - Hard to staff signing stipend (One time stipend of \$7,500)
3. **Nationwide Recruitment Strategy:** The recruitment objective is to attract quality applicants to fulfill TUSD and USP needs. TUSD will collaborate with the following entities to advertise open Administrator and Certificated Staff positions within TUSD:
  - Teachers of Color (print and web)

**Comment [NR17]:** MENDOZA: "Make the Move Program" does not specify that it targets Latino and African American candidates, a requirement of the USP. Further, the mandate of the USP is much broader than recruiting African American and Latino teachers for special education assignments. It requires that these groups be recruited for "open administrator and certificated staff positions." USP IV, C, 3 at 17.

**Comment [NR18]:** MENDOZA: Mendoza Plaintiffs concur with Fisher Plaintiffs' comments that these recruitment efforts are silent regarding how they will target African American and Latino candidates for "open administrator and certificated staff positions" as required by the USP. USP, IV, C, 3 at 17.

- Teach.gov (web)
- Teachers-Teachers (web)
- Want to Teach (web)
- Career Media Solutions –HBCU (print and web)
- American Association for Employment in Education
- Various college/university career center postings

4. Historically Black Colleges/Universities (HBCU) and Hispanic Association of Colleges/Universities (HACU): The goal is to increase the ethnic/racial diversity of TUSD's certificated staff to more closely reflect relevant labor market availability. This strategy includes the following activities:

- Recruitment trips to identified HBCU's and HACU's and other colleges and universities with teacher preparation programs with high numbers of minorities in the education department.
- Meet and Greet venues are held for Student Teachers from various colleges in Arizona to provide student teachers with information about TUSD and how to apply for vacant positions. Guest speakers from TUSD are invited to attend include Leadership teams, certification specialists, mentoring and professional development department, special education, and math innovation team.
- The recruitment and retention coordinator attends the U of AZ South campus in the fall to meet the new student teachers in the program. TUSD will create new and stronger relationships with in state colleges (University of Arizona, University of Arizona South, Teach Arizona, Pima Community College, Northern Arizona University, Grand Canyon College, Rio Salado College, University of Phoenix, Arizona State University, and Prescott College), and the African American Studies and Mexican American Studies program departments.
- Collaboration with HBCU and HACU to develop an internship program where students from various colleges and universities can perform their student teaching with TUSD.
- Welcome Groups- The purpose is to welcome new employees into TUSD. These group members consist of community members/district employees to assist in the adjustment period into the community and TUSD. Packets are developed for various ethnic groups that include community activities in Tucson and the surrounding areas.

5. Other Colleges and Universities: TUSD recruiter will recruit in highly populated diverse colleges and universities with a diverse student body in the College of Education.

6. Local and State-wide Job, Diversity, and Education Fairs and/or Expos: Local and State – wide Job, Diversity, and Education Fairs and/or Expos are provided for employers, recruiters and school districts to meet with prospective job seekers. In the college setting, education fairs are

**Comment [NR19]:** MENDOZA: Mendoza Plaintiffs concur with Fisher Plaintiffs that these entities do not adequately target Latino and African American candidates for certificated staff (non-teaching positions) and administrator positions as required in USP Section IV, C, 3, a, (i). Further, they do not target candidates with "Spanish language bilingual certifications." *Id.*

The USP requires the District to recruit Latino and African American candidates including through "(i) advertising job vacancies on national websites and publications, including career websites, national newspapers, education publications, and periodicals targeting African American and Latino communities." *Id.* The above list does not appear to include utilizing national newspapers, education publications and periodicals that target African American and Latino communities.

**Comment [NR20]:** MENDOZA: Mendoza Plaintiffs object to the omission of administrator and, specifically assistant principal and principal, positions in TUSD recruitment efforts.

commonly used for entry level teaching positions. Often sponsored by career centers, job fairs provide a convenient location for students to meet employers and participate in first interviews.

DRAFT



### E. Recruitment of Retired African American and Latino Administrators and Certificated Staff

TUSD recruiter will compile a list of retired African American and Hispanic administrators and certificated staff and send email announcements as positions for administrators and certificated staff are posted on the TUSD job listing.

**Comment [NR21]:** MENDOZA: This is the bare minimum the District can do and is not sufficiently specific to indicate whether it will meet the objective of the USP to "invite retired African American and Latino administrators and certificated staff to be considered for open positions for which they are qualified[.]" USP Section IV, C, 3 a, (ii) at 17. Mendoza Plaintiffs concur with the DOJ that the plan lacks details about how retired candidates are to apply for open positions, whether they will receive any preferences in hiring or whether any specific messages inviting these personnel to return will be offered. Mendoza Plaintiffs agree that specific messaging to African American and Latino retired personnel regarding how their experiences and skills will benefit the District and be utilized is critical to encouraging them to return to the District.

### F. Productive Partnerships

The recruitment outreach objective is to attract quality applicants to fulfill TUSD and USP needs. TUSD will collaborate with the following entities:

- Tucson Values Teachers
- Troops for Teachers
- Re-establish connection with Raytheon
- Local Chamber of Commerce (Metropolitan, Black, Hispanic)
- Pima One Stop
- DMAFB

TUSD builds partnerships with local companies that recruit nationally to build an alternative means of recruitment. Local corporations and government entities that recruit non local candidates are provided with informational materials about TUSD to share with family members. In turn, this facilitates the recruitment of work eligible family members about employment opportunities within TUSD.

**Comment [NR22]:** MENDOZA: The language here is not specific regarding the steps TUSD will take to build partnership with the groups identified in this section. The language should state what TUSD will do "to build[ ]and utilize[e]" partnerships in accordance with USP Section IV, C, 3, a (iii) at 18. The language in the plan states that "TUSD builds partnerships" and that local employers "are provided with informational materials about TUSD" but does not affirmatively state what TUSD will do to build these relationships.

### G. Teaching Career Development

The goal of this initiative is to create interest in education. Human Resources representatives conduct outreach seminars to introduce students to the diverse careers, rewards, and opportunities available in the education field. This program sparks interest in high school, college, and university students, TUSD paraprofessionals, and local professionals to explore K-12 teaching careers. Effectiveness of these programs is evaluated annually.

- High Schools: recruiter will partner with high school administrators to set up forums with students who are interested in teaching careers.
- Colleges and Universities: recruiter will visit the local college and university educational teacher programs to attract new teachers. In addition, the recruiter will visit diversity programs with a focus on African American and Latino studies programs to support USP obligations to create interest in a teaching career.
- Paraprofessionals: recruiter is researching the development of paraprofessional programs to provide support for African American and Latino non-certified staff who are interested in pursuing certification.

- **Professionals:** recruiter will continue to solicit interest at Davis-Monthan AFB and military spouse interested in teaching or other opportunities at TUSD.

#### IV. RETENTION

##### A. Evaluation of Disparities in the Attrition Rates of African American and Latino Administrators or Certificated Staff

###### 1. Assess Reasons for Disparities:

TUSD will assess the labor market study and District reports to identify potential disparities. If disparities are identified TUSD will work on addressing the disparities and identifying necessary corrective actions. As previous noted TUSD has done an excellent job at hiring African American and Latino Administrators and Teachers from the relevant market of professional in Arizona. TUSD will continue to promote and seek additional African American professional from surrounding states to continue to increase and promote the diversity of our District.

###### 2. Corrective Action Plan:

The corrective action plan is to develop strategies to minimize disparities indentified that shall continue to promote quality education for the students in our District. In addition, to further promote the rich and diverse cultures of our students and our communities.

###### 3. Remedial Plan:

The remedial plan is to utilize the labor market study results and any subsequent analysis and reports to address necessary corrective actions that shall promote greater representation of African American administrators and certificated staff to TUSD. TUSD shall continue to capitalized on what it does well and improve on areas that need further development for a conscious level of excellence.

##### B. Teacher Job Satisfaction Survey

Teacher focus groups have been created to enhance teacher interaction, communication, and support feedback sessions to improve TUSD's support efforts to improve retention rates. TUSD will organize focus groups to survey teachers each year by race, ethnicity, and school site to assess teachers overall job satisfaction and their interest in continuing to work in TUSD.

##### A. Hard-to-Fill Positions Focus Groups

Recruiter will conduct biannual focus groups to gather perspectives on certificated staff in hard to fill positions (ELL, Special education teachers).

**Comment [NR23]:** MENDOZA: Mendoza Plaintiffs concur with DOJ comments that these efforts are "prospective and only generally described." There is insufficient information to determine whether these efforts are sufficient to comply with the USP requirement to "develop local programs to identify and support local high school, college and university students to interest them in teaching careers" and "encourage and provide support for African American and Latino non-certificated staff ... who are interested in pursuing certification." USP Section IV, C, 3, a, (iv), (v).

**Comment [NR24]:** MENDOZA: Mendoza Plaintiffs concur with the comments of Dr. Hawley that the proposed plan does not address "measures intended to increase the retention of African American and Latino administrators or certificated staff." USP, Section IV, F, 1 at 20. The plan instead addresses disparities between the LMA and District administrators and certificated staff. The evaluation of disparities of attrition rates of African American and Latino administrators and certificated staff should utilize the teacher survey conducted in principal evaluations referenced in the USP Section IV, H, 1 at 22.

**Comment [NR25]:** MENDOZA: Mendoza Plaintiffs OBJECT to this characterization of TUSD hiring efforts and await a response to their questions on the Labor Market Analysis to determine the validity of its findings.

**Comment [n26]:** MENDOZA: This is not what the USP requires. The USP requires an evaluation of whether there are disparities in the attrition rates of African American and Latino certificated staff or administrators and to assess the reasons for the disparities and to develop a corrective action plan to address them. USP Section IV, F, 1, a at 20.

**Comment [n27]:** MENDOZA: Under the USP, the survey results must be disaggregated by race, ethnicity and school site and be anonymous. USP Section IV, F, 1, b at 20. These requirements must be included in the plan.