

APPENDIX I – 5

**Brown, Samuel**

---

**From:** Brown, Samuel  
**Sent:** Friday, April 15, 2016 5:11 PM  
**To:** Willis D. Hawley; Alexander Chanock; Bruce Converse (BConverse@steptoe.com); James Eichner; Juan Rodriguez; Lois Thompson; Paul Charlton; Rubin Salter Jr.; Shaheena Simons (shaheena.simons@usdoj.gov)  
**Cc:** Tolleson, Julie; Taylor, Martha  
**Subject:** Roberts Naylor Report  
**Attachments:** 20160415 Roberts Naylor Report.pdf

Dr. Hawley/Counsel: pursuant to Order 1909 re grade reconfigurations, please find attached the District's report on Roberts-Naylor K-8. Have a great weekend, Sam

**Samuel Emiliano Brown**

Legal Counsel  
Tucson Unified School District  
(520) 225-6040

This communication is attorney/client privileged and confidential and solely for the identified recipient. Any disclosure, copying, distribution, or use of the contents of this communication is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please immediately destroy it and notify the sender by reply e-mail.

## Roberts-Naylor Report: Academics, Demographics, and Feasibility of Actual and/or Potential Transformative Measures

### 1. Intro

In its March 8, 2016 Order (ECF 1909), the Court directed the District as follows:

*TUSD shall prepare a detailed report regarding the academic and demographic conditions at Roberts-Naylor and describe the measures, if any, which have been or could be taken by TUSD to transform Roberts-Naylor into a viable K-8 program capable of competing with the middle schools now attracting the Borman students. TUSD should explain why or why not it is feasible to implement any such identified measures. TUSD should consider a time line to accomplish a transformation at Roberts-Naylor sufficient to begin attracting students that currently choose to go elsewhere.*

The following report includes information on the academic and demographic conditions at Roberts-Naylor K-8 school.

### 2. Demographic Conditions

#### Race/Ethnicity

The racial and ethnic demographics at Roberts-Naylor have remained fairly consistent over the past four years. Roberts-Naylor was an Integrated schools pursuant to the USP in the 2012-13, 2013-14, and 2014-15 school years. Based on the 40<sup>th</sup> day information for the 2015-16 school year, Roberts-Naylor has experienced an increase in the percentages of African American students (22% to 26%) and a corresponding decrease in the percentages of Hispanic students (58% to 54%). This change has resulted in Roberts-Naylor falling out of the 15% variance of “Integrated” pursuant to the USP. However, Roberts-Naylor meets the criteria of a highly diverse school because it has two students groups more that 25% of its population.

Status	School	White		African American		Hispanic/Latino		Native American		Asian/Pacific Islander		Multi Racial		Total	
		N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%		
K-8 Schools	K-8 Total	1516	919	11%	726	9%	5962	71%	437	5%	107	1%	242	3%	8393
		1415	902	11%	663	8%	6008	72%	444	5%	111	1%	239	3%	8367
		1314	961	12%	582	7%	5898	71%	514	6%	124	1%	259	3%	8338
		1213	915	12%	456	6%	5713	74%	453	6%	122	2%	49	1%	7708
Neutral	Roberts-Naylor	1516	67	11%	162	26%	338	54%	14	2%	32	5%	9	1%	622
<u>Int</u>		1415	58	9%	137	22%	364	58%	17	3%	31	5%	21	3%	628
<u>Int</u>		1314	66	11%	97	16%	358	60%	19	3%	34	6%	24	1%	598
<u>Int</u>		1213	65	11%	68	11%	415	67%	21	3%	44	7%	3	0%	616

Other Demographic Conditions

Roberts-Naylor has a diverse population. Sixty-seven (67%) of Roberts-Naylor receive free and reduced lunch. The District average for free and reduced lunch is approximately 75-80%. Thirty-four percent (34%) of Roberts-Naylor students are English Language Learners (ELLs). Twenty percent (20%) of Roberts-Naylor's student population are refugees from around the world (Congo Republic, Iraq, Syria, Bhutan, others). Beyond English and Spanish, over 19 world languages are spoken, including Arabic, Somali, and Nepalese.

Neighborhood/Non-Neighborhood

Included in the chart below are K-5, 6-8, and K-8 neighborhood and non-neighborhood students by race and ethnicity. The 6-8 student demographics are fairly consistent between both groups with only a higher percentage of Anglo students in the non-neighborhood group and, overall; one in five students come from outside the neighborhood. At the K-5 level, neighborhood students have a higher percentage of Anglo and Asian-PI students compared to the non-neighborhood group; the non-neighborhood group has a higher percentage of African American students. The K-8 data indicates that African American student percentages are higher in the non-neighborhood group (25% to 17%) and Asian-PI student percentages are lower (0% to 6%). Both groups have created a diverse and well-integrated student enrollment.

K-5 Neighborhood Students						
Anglo	Afr Am	Hispanic	Nat Am	Asian-PI	Multiracial	Total
56	68	247	8	28	15	422
13%	16%	59%	2%	7%	4%	
K-5 Non-Neighborhood Students						
Anglo	Afr Am	Hispanic	Nat Am	Asian-PI	Multiracial	Total
3	13	26	2	0	1	45
7%	29%	58%	4%	0%	2%	

6-8 Neighborhood Students						
Anglo	Afr Am	Hispanic	Nat Am	Asian-PI	Multiracial	Total
22	37	136	3	7	6	211
10%	18%	64%	1%	3%	3%	
6-8 Non-Neighborhood Students						
Anglo	Afr Am	Hispanic	Nat Am	Asian-PI	Multiracial	Total
8	12	34	1	0	0	55
15%	22%	62%	2%	0%	0%	

K-8 Neighborhood Students						
Anglo	Afr Am	Hispanic	Nat Am	Asian-PI	Multiracial	Total
78	105	383	11	35	21	633
12%	17%	61%	2%	6%	3%	
K-8 Non-Neighborhood Students						
Anglo	Afr Am	Hispanic	Nat Am	Asian-PI	Multiracial	Total
11	25	60	3	0	1	100
11%	25%	60%	3%	0%	1%	

### 3. Academic Conditions

In reviewing the academic data at Roberts-Naylor from the past three years, the trends show that overall proficiency rates are above average for elementary grades (3-5) and below average for middle school grades (6-8). On balance, the school as a whole has had proficiency rates below the district averages compared to other K-8 schools.

	12-13 AIMS PROFICIENCY RATE		13-14 AIMS PROFICIENCY RATE		14-15 AZ Merit PROFICIENCY RATE	
	ELA	MATH	ELA	MATH	ELA	MATH
RN 3-5	64	68	73	65	23	24
TUSD 3-5 AVG	74	58	74	58	20	22
	-10	+10	+1	+7	+3	+2
RN 6-8	65	52	64	44	11	10
TUSD 6-8 AVG	72	48	71	47	25	21
	-7	+4	-7	-3	-14	-11
RN 3-8	64	54	67	52	15	16
TUSD 3-8 AVG	73	53	72	53	24	23
	-9	+1	-5	-1	-9	-9

Roberts-Naylor has 30 certified classroom teachers with an average experience level of 12 years. It offers a myriad of supports for students to address academic and language needs, including a full-time Reading Interventionist and a Curriculum Service Provider to assist teachers and students. Students have access to technology such as SuccessMaker twice a week along with additional classroom time. Staff target third through fifth grade students in need of Tier 3 intervention (the bottom 25%), or who are identified as “intensive” on the DIBELS assessment. Roberts-Naylor currently offers GATE language arts courses for 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> grades. ELD students receive additional support through a computer based program, Imagine Learning, five days a week. Teachers provide after-school tutoring throughout the week but always on Monday and Wednesday. In conjunction with surrounding community organizations, facilitates the Good News Club to provide tutoring for students after school. Additionally, Roberts-Naylor partners with the Boys and Girls Club and the nearby library to provide additional services to students based on staff identification of at-risk students. They work with students below grade level and offer assistance with initiating and using a personal account for Achieve 3000 – a self-paced computer program.

#### 4. Transformative Measures

##### Prior and Current Measures

Roberts-Naylor offers the Wright Flight program, Culture Festivals, Guitar Grant Participation (2<sup>nd</sup> Year) to students. Through another grant, over 4,000 books were donated and given to students throughout the school to improve literacy. Building relationships between students and staff is a focus from the first day of school as all members of the Roberts-Naylor community create, “This is my story...” student and teacher boards to let others know about the background and talents they bring. Additional supports are provided to students through the Mentor Program between Staff and Students and the Oasis Mentoring Program. Current electives offered at Roberts-Naylor include Band, Orchestra, Art, PE and Technology.

Currently, Robert-Naylor hosted student visits during the District’s Level-Up Days. Students from Myers-Ganoung, Wheeler, and Borman toured the campus. Students were mailed a brochure to follow-up on the visit and highlight the opportunities that Roberts-Naylor offers. Additionally, to recruit students from Borman, a counselor and 6<sup>th</sup> grade students will plan a visit to Borman to talk to their 5<sup>th</sup> graders about Roberts-Naylor. The principal will attend a parent meeting at Borman to answer questions they might have and to encourage their child’s enrollment. The school has worked with the marketing department to develop a marketing video to highlight the special qualities of the school. Finally, a parent meeting will be held at Roberts/Naylor including presentation to give families a sample of a typical day at a K-8 and possibly include student performances and speakers.

##### Potential Future Attractors

To determine necessary transformations that would make Roberts-Naylor competitive with the middle schools now attracting Borman students, the District first had to determine what factors were attracting Borman families to the middle schools they were attending. The District researched programmatic offerings at competing middle schools and developed a survey to identify and assess these factors. *See Attachment A, Summary of Survey Results.*

Based on available information, several middle schools attract students from the base for middle school: Sonoran Science Academy (Charter); Alice Vail Middle School (TUSD); Vail School District middle schools; Private Parochial Schools. Based on available information, the District has identified the primary factors that contribute to parents’ decisions regarding middle school off-base (safety and security; special academic programs) and on-base (safety and security; proximity to home; keeping students within the military community). Two of those factors (proximity to home; keeping students within the military community) cannot be replicated at Roberts-Naylor.

Based on available information, the District has identified the least important factors that contribute to parents’ decisions regarding middle school off-base (proximity to work; keeping siblings together; keeping students within the military community) and on-base (after-

care/extend day; special academic programs; accommodations for exceptional education services; ethnic and cultural diversity).

Two of the factors identified as attractive to parents (keeping students within the military community and proximity to home) cannot be replicated at Roberts-Naylor. Two of the factors could potentially be replicated (special academic programs; safety and security) to make Roberts-Naylor more competitive with the schools currently attracting middle school students both on and off base. Families who stay on base for middle school do not list special academic programs as an important consideration.

### Feasibility of Potential Measures and Timelines

#### *Security and Safety*

On the Roberts-Naylor School Quality Survey, students and parents rated the following statements on a continuum of Agree/Strongly Agree (A/SA) or Disagree/Strongly Disagree (D/SD). The following statements and responses are from the 2014-15 and 2013-14 school year:

	2014- 15		2013-14	
	A/SA	D/SD	A/SA	D/SD
Students (grades 3 – 8):				
<i>I feel safe at school</i>	77.9%	22.1%	75.9%	24.1%
<i>Students behave in class</i>	47.4%	52.4%	55.1%	44.9%
<i>This year I have rarely been the victim of bullying</i>	58.2%	41.8%	67.1%	32.9%
<i>I feel welcome at my school</i>	82.7%	17.3%	82.4%	17.5%
Parents (of students in grades 3-8)				
<i>The school is a safe place for students</i>	87.3%	12.7%	89.2%	10.7%
<i>Students behave during class</i>	80.8%	19.2%	87.3%	12.7%
<i>I rarely hear that students bully or harass others</i>	61.4%	38.6%	75.1%	24.9%
<i>When I visit the school office, the staff is friendly</i>	93.3%	6.8%	95.2%	4.8%

Based on the available information, parents who send their children to Roberts-Naylor feel that safety is not an issue. Although the student responses are slightly lower, the majority of students also feel safe at school. There may be perception issue that can be addressed through positive marketing strategies and campus tours, which the District is actively engaged in currently.

#### *Special Academic Programs*

The following is a list of possible programs to consider adding to Roberts-Naylor:

- AVID - Advancement Via Individual Determination (AVID) operates with one guiding principle: Hold students accountable to the highest standards provide academic and social support, and they will rise to the challenge. AVID's kindergarten through higher

education system brings research-based curriculum and strategies to students each day that develop critical thinking, literacy, and math skills across all content areas.

*Timeline – AVID could begin as early as 2016-17 school year*

- Advanced Learning Experiences – such as Self-Contained GATE, Honors classes, High school credit classes may attract some families. There are existing Self-Contained GATE programs at Lineweaver Elementary School (K-5) and Alice Vail Middle School (6-8) which are both in close proximity to the base and to Roberts-Naylor.

*Timeline – to institute enhanced ALE opportunities, the District would need to assign additional FTE, rework master schedules, and recruit qualified staff and interested students. This work could begin in the fall of 2016 for the 2017-18 school year.*

- Specialized classes/programs – such as Virtual Reality lab, Robotics, Engineering, World Languages might appeal to students who have those career paths in mind.

*Timeline – to add specialized classes the District would need to assign additional FTE, rework master schedules, and recruit qualified staff and interested students. Planning could begin in November of 2016-17 for the 2017-18 school year. However, the school facilities would need to be assessed to see if it can accommodate any specialized equipment and needs. This may also have an impact on the site's budget request for 2016-17.*

## **5. Conclusion**

Based on the information available from the parent surveys and the feasibility that adding programs might draw a small sample of parents to Roberts-Naylor, it is likely that substantial changes at Roberts-Naylor could improve the quality of education for the students attending, but it is unlikely that such changes would result in attracting significant numbers of students from the base to attend Roberts-Naylor. This is due to the fact that the majority of parents on base elect to stay on base regardless of the alternative options – even where the alternatives demonstrate higher levels of academic achievement (Sonoran Science Academy is a “C” school just like Roberts-Naylor) and where they might offer special programs (note: the survey results indicated that the availability of special academic programs is one of the least important factors in parent choice for base families).



### Attachment 1 – Summary of Base Survey

The District developed a 17 item on-line questionnaire to gather information about the school choices made by parents living on the Davis Monthan Air Force Base. Soaring Heights, the residential agency that manages housing for military families on Base, distributed the survey to 1,088 individuals via an email blast. There were 108 responses, representing a response rate of 10%. Of the 108 households that responded, 11 did not have children under 18 living with them. There were therefore a total of 97 relevant responses.

#### School Choice

Parents were asked to identify whether they had elementary, middle school or high school grade children, and the schools they were attended. Out of the 97 households responding, five indicated that their children were home-schooled, while two others attend on-line schools (e.g. Arizona Virtual Academy). As shown in the Table 1 below, the majority of attendants were enrolled in Borman Elementary (note: a couple of respondents had more than one student). An additional 23 households (24%) indicated that their child was enrolled in a school for 6<sup>th</sup> through 8<sup>th</sup> grade. The majority of these students attended the base middle school - Sonoran Science Academy (SSA-DM). Ten (10) indicated that their child attended a high school. Sixty percent (60%) of these students attended a school off base.

**Table 1. School Choice**

<b>Elementary Students</b>	<b>Number of Students</b>	<b>Percentage of total respondents</b>
Borman	52	79%
Other TUSD school	6	9%
Vail SD	3	5%
Charter	3	5%
Parochial	2	3%
<i>Total</i>	<i>66</i>	
<b>Middle School Students</b>	<b>Number of Students</b>	<b>Percentage of total respondents</b>
SSA-DM	14	61%
TUSD school	3	13%
Vail School District	2	9%
Charter	1	4%
Parochial	3	13%
<i>Total</i>	<i>23</i>	
<b>High School Students</b>	<b>Number of Students</b>	<b>Percentage of total respondents</b>
TUSD school	5	22%
SSA-DM	4	17%
Tanque Verde	1	4%
<i>Total</i>	<i>10</i>	

Factors affecting school choice

Parents who had children enrolled in a base school (Borman Elementary or SSA-DM) or a school located off the base were asked to indicate the importance of various factors in choosing the school (scale ranged from not at all important to very important).

The most important factors in choosing the base schools (those they had in common) were 1) proximity to home, 2) safety and security, and 3) keeping their child in a military community. The least important factor was after-care/extended day. These results make sense within the context that they have chosen to remain on base and that the need for longer time at school is unnecessary.

Not surprisingly, households who sent their children to off-base schools identified a different set of factors. Although safety and security received the highest ratings, special academic programs (e.g. Honors, AP, GATE), state school rankings, and school personnel were also important. This suggests that parents who are sending their children off-base place more importance on the academics of a school. The least important factors were proximity to work, keeping sibling together, and keeping a child in a military community.